

10

REPORT

OF THE

Executive Committee

OF THE

New York

Civil Service Reform Association

SUBMITTED AT THE ANNUAL MEETING,
MAY 14, 1913.

LIST OF MEMBERS, ETC.

NEW YORK
PUBLISHED FOR THE
CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ASSOCIATION
79 WALL STREET
1913

Publications of the National Civil Service Reform League

- Proceedings at the Annual Meetings of the National Civil Service Reform League, 1894 to 1912, inclusive, (excepting 1895 and 1898, out of print).**
- A Review of the Year.** By Carl Schurz. (Address of 1898.)
- Renewed Struggles.** By Carl Schurz. (Address of 1899.)
- Some Object Lessons.** By Carl Schurz. (Address of 1903.)
- Can We Trust Our Army to Spoilsmen?** By Charles J. Bonaparte. (1898.)
- The Reform in the Consular Service.** By Oscar S. Strauss. (1895.)
- Results of Recent Agitation of Consular Service—Their Value—What Next?** By Jonathan A. Lane. (1895.)
- An Open Letter to Hon. C. H. Grosvenor,** in reply to recent attacks on the Civil Service Law and Rules. By George McAneny. (1897.)
- The Need and Best Means for Providing a Competent and Stable Civil Service for Our New Dependencies.** By Dorman B. Eaton. (1898.)
- The Choice of Correct Methods in the Administration of American Dependencies.** By Elliot H. Goodwin. (1900.)
- Four Reports.** Prepared by the Investigating Committee of the National Civil Service Reform League. (1901.)
- Superannuation in the Civil Service.** Reports of Special Committees. (1901, 1906, 1907, 1909, 1910 and 1911.)
- Withdrawals from the Civil Service.** Report of a Special Committee of the League. (1906.)
- The Situation in Porto Rico.** Report of the Committee on the Civil Service in Dependencies, (1902.)
- Governor Hughes on Civil Service Reform.** Address of Governor Charles E. Hughes, of New York, at the Annual Meeting of the League. (1907.)
- The Business Value of Civil Service Reform.** (Third Revised Edition.) (1913.)
- Activity of Federal Office Holders in Politics.** Report of a Special Committee of the League. (1909.)
- The Fundamental Reform.** By President Charles W. Eliot. (Address of 1909.)
- Things Won and Greater Things Not Yet Won.** By President Charles W. Eliot. (Address of 1910.)
- Promotions in the Civil Service.** Report of a Special Committee of the League. (1910.)
- Politics vs. the Administration of Justice.** By Hon. Winfred T. Denison. (1910.)
- Coal Hod Politics.** By Hon. Winfred T. Denison. (1911.)
- The Relation of Organized Labor to Civil Service Reform.** By Hon. Samuel B. Donnelly. (1911.)
- Civil Service Reform and Popular Government.** By President Charles W. Eliot. (Address of 1911.)
- Draft of a Civil Service Law for Cities.** Prepared by a Special Committee of the League. (1912.)
- The Merit System and the New Democratic Party.** By President Charles W. Eliot. (Address of 1912.)

REPORT

OF THE

Executive Committee

OF THE

New York

Civil Service Reform Association

SUBMITTED AT THE ANNUAL MEETING,
MAY 14, 1913.

LIST OF MEMBERS, ETC.

NEW YORK

PUBLISHED FOR THE
CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ASSOCIATION
79 WALL STREET

1913

PRESS OF
GEORGE G. PECK
117 CHAMBERS STREET
NEW YORK

CONTENTS

Annual Report of the Executive Committee - 5

Appendix:


The Work of the State Civil Service Commission 24

Annual Report of the Treasurer - - - 35

Constitution and By-Laws - - - 37

Roll of Officers and Members . - - 45

Articles of Incorporation - - - 67



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from

This project is made possible by a grant from the Institute of Museum and Library Services as administered by the Pennsylvania Department of Education through the Office of Commonwealth Libraries.

ANNUAL REPORT

OF THE

Executive Committee of the Civil Service Reform Association.

Before reviewing the work of the year, the Committee records with profound regret the death of one of the foremost supporters of the merit system. Colonel Silas W. Burt, President of the Association since 1907, died on November 30. Colonel Burt was one of the pioneers in the cause of civil service reform and was active from the beginning in the work of the Association, first as a member of this Committee, then as the Association's President. He has been succeeded in the presidency by Hon. Everett P. Wheeler.

THE FEDERAL SERVICE AND OTHER STATES

THE CLASSIFICATION OF FOURTH-CLASS POSTMASTERS

During the four years of President Taft's administration the merit system in the federal service was not only maintained in extent and vigor, but its application was still further widened and strengthened. The greatest single step in advance was the issue of an Executive order on October 15 last whereby 36,000 fourth-class postmasters were brought within the competitive classified service. This order completed the reform in the lowest grade of the post office service begun by President Roosevelt in 1908, when as an experiment the fourth-class postmasters in the territory north of the Ohio and Potomac Rivers and east of the

Mississippi were made competitive. The success of the experiment was soon shown in marked improvements in the conduct of the business of the offices and the office facilities themselves provided by postmasters who felt that their tenure no longer depended on political pull but on merit and efficient service. The National Civil Service Reform League, through whose efforts the Roosevelt order of 1908 was secured, consistently urged that the classification be completed, and therefore welcomed the order of October 15 as a step absolutely necessary to stop the scandal of political manipulation of these small offices and to place this branch of the postal service on an economical and efficient basis.

President Taft's order has been assailed by his critics in the Democratic party, who charge that it was issued for political reasons to give protection from removal to the present incumbents, who are Republicans. The criticisms, which began to appear immediately after the order was issued, were followed by an attempt by certain of the Democrats in Congress to repeal the order by legislation at the concluding session of the last Congress. The proposal for repeal was made in the form of a rider to the post office appropriation bill and applied not only to the order of October, 1912, but to an order of September 30, 1910, classifying 2,500 assistant postmasters and 1,500 post-office clerks. The rider was, however, defeated on a roll call by a vote of 107 to 141, 40 Democrats to their credit voting against it. To repeal the order would be a disastrous step backward and one which we are glad to say President Wilson has shown no signs of approving. The President, however, has just issued an Executive order requiring all fourth-class postmasters who were "covered in" to the classified service to enter competitive examinations before being given a competitive classified status. This is an entirely new experiment in the federal service and one the operation of which will be watched with interest and care.

THE TENURE OF OFFICE RIDER

Last summer an attempt was made in Congress to fasten on the service in the District of Columbia a fixed term for every government employee. The proposal was embodied in a rider to one of the appropriation bills and at first provided for a term of five years, at the end of which every employee who was not re-appointed should be regarded as dismissed from the service. In this form the bill passed the House, but through the efforts of the National Civil Service Reform League the rider was struck out by the Senate. In its place the Senate inserted a new section providing for a system of efficiency records for the entire federal service, to be kept under the supervision of the Civil Service Commission and to serve as an automatic basis for promotion, reduction or dismissal. In conference the bill was again changed; the efficiency provisions were retained, but a new tenure of office provision was inserted, differing from the original only in that the term was made seven years instead of five. In spite of the active opposition of various organizations, including the National Civil Service Reform League, and the general condemnation of the proposal in the press, the bill in this form was passed. Fortunately President Taft utterly disapproved the fixed term idea and refused to approve the bill with this rider in it. The two-thirds majority necessary to pass the bill over the veto could not be secured and the attempt was fortunately defeated. At the same time, however, the provisions for an efficiency system were retained and a distinct gain was thus made.

THE NEW ADMINISTRATION

The change in administration in Washington has, it is gratifying to say, been marked by no indications that the President will lend his support or sympathy to any breaking down of the civil service law. President Wilson was for two years a vice-president of the National Civil Service Reform League and is known

to be in hearty sympathy with the merit system. Of the members of the new Cabinet, the most important with respect to the civil service, at least, is the Postmaster-General, Mr. Burleson. He has repeatedly stated that it was his intention to remove the postal service entirely from politics and that he strongly favored the competitive classification of all postmasters of whatever grade. His attitude is peculiarly gratifying, in view of the attacks on the classification of fourth-class postmasters by members of the party in Congress and of the likelihood that other attacks will call for courageous and determined resistance from the executive branch of the government if they are to be defeated.

The question of appointments to important federal offices outside the classified service has been one of the central topics of discussion in the press. This Committee confines its attention as to federal appointments to the local federal offices in New York. So far the only changes of much importance have been in the District Attorney's office and in the collectorship of the port. It is gratifying to note that the new district attorney has declared he intends to make no radical changes in the personnel of his force. The collectorship of the port has been given to Hon. John Purroy Mitchel, president of the New York City Board of Aldermen. The choosing of a successor to Mr. Loeb has been the center of a three-cornered struggle, with the Secretary of the Treasury on one side supporting his personal choice, independent Democrats on another side urging the appointment of a leader of that faction, and Senator O'Gorman as the third party defending his claim as Senator from New York to the right to name the New York collector. Whatever may be the qualifications of any of the candidates suggested, this affair has been a conspicuous illustration of the manner in which unclassified positions in the government service are commonly treated. The qualifications of the candidates have been a matter of incidental importance in the newspaper discussion

of the squabble. Instead the collectorship has been regarded as the richest plum on the New York tree, and has been made the object of maneuvers and struggles for political advantage. It is to be hoped that the time will soon come when the use of purely administrative positions of this sort as the footballs of politics will be forever ended by the extension to all such places of the protection of the civil service law and rules.

PROGRESS IN OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY

That civil service reform has to-day the support and backing of the voters has been several-times demonstrated during the last year, as in years before. In New Jersey the people of the city of Paterson and of the county of Passaic adopted the state civil service law by large majorities at the November elections. In Colorado through the initiative amendments have been inserted in the civil service law by the people directly which extend its provisions to practically all except elective officers. And finally the Ohio legislature just before adjournment late in April passed a comprehensive civil service law covering not only the state service, but the services of every city and county in the state. This law was the result of the adoption by the people in September of a constitutional amendment providing for the merit system similar to the constitutional provision here. The majority in favor of the amendment was over 102,000, the second largest majority given for any of the fifty-odd amendments voted for at the same time.

THE STATE SERVICE

THE NEW CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

The administration of Governor Dix with its unequalled record of wholesale exemptions from competition, of broken promises and bad faith with the supporters of the merit system, passed into history on

January 1. Of the Commission for which he was responsible and whose acts he almost consistently approved, it is enough to say here that during the last few months of their term in office they did little if anything to redeem their earlier ugly record and that that record had no little to do with the general condemnation of Governor Dix, to whom his party refused the honor of a renomination.

Governor Sulzer entered on his term on January 1 under the following pledge to support the civil service law:

"I am in favor of the merit system and have been a consistent friend of civil service reform all my life. If I am elected governor there will be no step backwards. I stand squarely in favor of the merit system and the greatest efficiency in the civil service."

Among the first of his acts was the appointment of an entirely new civil service commission. The new president, Jacob L. Neu, of Brooklyn, had been conspicuous in politics and at one time was a municipal court judge. Dr. Meyer Wolff, the other Democratic member, is a physician, active as a Democrat for several years, and a strong supporter of Governor Sulzer in the campaign. The Republican member, James A. Lavery, of Poughkeepsie, has been identified with the work of labor unions and is a newspaper editor in Poughkeepsie. He was a speaker for Mr. Hedges, the Republican candidate, in the campaign of 1912. While none of the new commissioners had, as far as could be learned, ever been identified with civil service matters or actively interested in them, and their appointments were therefore somewhat disappointing, this Committee has earnestly hoped that the Commission would take a high attitude toward the performance of their duties.

Within a few weeks of their appointment Governor Sulzer declared that it was his desire that the Commission and this Association co-operate in every way possible on matters of moment affecting the administration of the law, and at his suggestion the Commis-

sion asked the Association to appoint a committee for this purpose. This suggestion was heartily welcomed by this Committee and a special committee was forthwith appointed, consisting of Mr. Samuel H. Ordway, Chairman of the Executive Committee, as Chairman; Mr. Everett P. Wheeler, President of the Association; Mr. Nelson S. Spencer, Chairman of the Committee on Administration; Mr. Ansley Wilcox, President of the Buffalo Association, and Robt. W. Belcher, Secretary of the Association. This Committee met with the Commissioners at a meeting in New York in February and later sent the Commission a letter suggesting a number of matters which the Committee hoped might be taken up as the basis of constructive work. At the same time the Committee at the request of the Commission submitted a brief opposing a vicious proposal to permit transfers between the services of New York City and its counties and the Commission accepted the Committee's views and turned down the proposal. None of the suggestions in the letter, however, have been taken up by the Commission, but deserve its early consideration.

QUESTIONS OF CLASSIFICATION

The Commissioners have been unusually diligent in their five months of existence, having held over thirty meetings since January 1. A number of miscellaneous exemptions, about 21 in all, have been granted. Many of these, like a file and index clerk in the office of the Governor, a custodian in the office of the county clerk of Kings County, two inspectors in the office of the State Hospital Commission, etc., are entirely unjustifiable. The Commission has, in fact, displayed a tendency to give too much weight to the outworn plea of "confidential relations" so frequently and monotonously advanced as grounds for exemption. In a number of other cases, such as the request of the State Fire Marshal for the exemption of a number of additional places in his office and the request of the Commissioner of Agriculture for the transfer from

the competitive to the exempt class of six assistant commissioners of agriculture, the Commission has taken no action, but at least deserve credit for not having given way in the spineless fashion of their predecessors to unwarrantable proposals of this sort.

Greatly to its credit the Commission has recently made two important extensions of the rules, one to cover the position of probation officer in all counties of the state and the other to cover all positions in tuberculosis hospitals in all counties of the state. The number of positions which will be made competitive by this extension has not been definitely determined, inasmuch as the salaries of probation officers in some counties are extremely low, and this will affect their classification. Four counties whose entire services are not now under the civil service rules have already established tuberculosis hospitals, and others are understood to have their establishment under consideration. These two extensions mark real advances in the state, and both were urged upon the Commission by this Association, as well as by other organizations, including the State Probation Commission and the State Charities Aid Association.

LAXITY IN IMPORTANT DETAILS

Giving the Commission all due credit for these extensions and the diligence of its members, we regret to have to say that on a number of matters of importance affecting the details of its work the Commission has shown an attitude of, to say the last, extreme laxity. The Committee of Administration recently made a careful investigation into the Commission's work through an examination of the minutes of the meetings held during the past year. The result of that examination was to disclose a number of facts about the Commission's work which show that the Commission is lacking either in understanding of the importance of rigid enforcement of the law even in matters of detail, or of a proper desire to see such enforcement. The matters were of such importance that

a letter was sent the Commission by the Special Committee appointed at the Governor's suggestion calling the Commission's attention to the dangers in the course they had followed. No reply was received to this letter, and after a wait of some ten days, on May 2 a copy of the letter was sent the Governor with a request that he give it his personal attention. On May 6 the Governor replied, saying in part, "You can rely on me to give my personal attention and earnest consideration to all that you say. Will take these matters up with the Commission and do everything in my power to carry out your suggestions." This correspondence is printed in full in an appendix to this report. This Committee cannot regard the matter except with grave concern. It is a discredit to the civil service law if the rights of other competitors in a civil service examination are to be slighted and disregarded as in the case of Somerville, the chief clerk in the State Engineer and Surveyor's office, whose average rating was increased on appeal eight per cent., and whose standing on the list was thereby changed from 16 to 3, admitting of his permanent appointment. Arbitrarily to raise the mark of a personal favorite of a department head in even a non-competitive examination from 58 to 75 after two failures in order to permit his promotion and an increase in his salary of \$400, as was done in another case, is so astonishing as to be incomprehensible. It is further a ground for serious criticism that the so-called "special exception" clause of the law has been so liberally resorted to. This is the clause which permits the Commission to waive the requirement of competition for a particular position in the competitive class where the position is one calling for "peculiar and exceptional qualifications of a scientific, technical or educational character" in which the person to be appointed is one of "high and recognized attainments" and where competition is shown to be impracticable as a means of obtaining such an appointee. This provision the present Commission has in less than four months already exercised in eleven cases, as compared with its application by

the New York City Commission in only four cases in all of last year in a service many times larger than that under the State Commission. The exceptions include such positions as court messenger under the surrogates of New York County and a special agent in the office of the State Commissioner of Agriculture. In one case the "person of high and recognized attainments" in "qualifications of a scientific, technical or educational character" was a clerk in the Surrogate's office, and the other had been a meat inspector in New York City, a clerk in the New York City Finance Department and then successively a laborer and special agent in the Department of Agriculture. This Committee had occasion to criticise the Dix Commission for action under this provision of the law little, if any, worse than some of these. It earnestly hopes that the present Commission will reform its own attitude on this matter, as well as on the several other matters of important detail mentioned.

THE DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

As the result of two years of investigation by the Factory Commission, the Legislature early this year passed a bill which became law with the Governor's approval thoroughly reorganizing the State Department of Labor. One of the results intended to be reached by this new legislation was a reorganization of the inspection force, making necessary the creation of a considerable number of new positions. The protection of the lives, health and safety of the thousands of men, women and children employed in the factories of the state make it absolutely necessary that this department and its inspection force particularly be kept free absolutely from all political influences whatsoever. In spite of this, on April 19 Commissioner Williams applied to the State Commission for the exemption of 28 positions in the reorganized department, including 10 special inspectors and 5 of the highest grade inspectors, who must be scientifically and technically trained men. Others of the exemptions proposed were

utterly ridiculous, and only two in the entire list can be justified at all. The Association succeeded in securing a postponement of action on the matter and a public hearing was given by the Commission in New York City. In addition to this Association, a large number of other organizations interested in labor reform were represented and protested vigorously against this raid on the service of a department whose administration so vitally and directly affects the well-being of the great mass of the population of the state. The Commission has not yet announced its decision, but it is hard to believe that in this, the first important test of its attitude, it will be found on the side of the spoilsman.

LEGISLATION

In the session just closed an unusually large number of bills affecting the administration of the civil service law passed. Some of them have already been approved and become law. None of the Association's bills was advanced and several of the bills which would have materially injured the merit system in the state and city have been defeated. Two bills of special importance which have passed but have not yet become laws are the Walker removal bill and the Wagner bill establishing a board of public welfare in New York City.

The Walker removal bill is the most vicious amendment to the New York civil service law which we have had to fight. It not only gives to every employee in the competitive classified service of the state, its cities, counties and villages the right to a trial before removal, but also the right to have his removal reviewed by the courts under a writ of certiorari. The bill in one form or another has been introduced in the legislature for several years in succession, but this is the first time it has ever got to the Governor. Its effect on the discipline of the departments and efficiency in administration would be disastrous and it has always been opposed by the Association for these reasons. It passed the Assembly early in April without difficulty

and passed the Senate on the last day of the session by a strict party vote. The Association has asked the Governor for a hearing and earnestly urges all friends of the cause to use their influence to secure its veto.

The Wagner bill establishing a department of public welfare in New York City would take from the police department the duty of enforcing the laws against gambling and vice and place this in a separate department. By an express provision of this bill the inspectors or police in the department are to be chosen without any civil service examination at all, their appointment being left entirely to the board of public welfare. This bill is now before the Mayor for his approval.

The so-called home rule act which became a law a few weeks ago was opposed by the Association because its language was so extremely vague that it may admit of a construction which will remove the civil service commission of every city in the state from the supervision of the State Commission. This is denied by the sponsors of the act, but it is conceded that it will take much lengthy litigation to determine what powers are actually given cities and what the act really means.

Another important bill which has become law is an amendment to the civil service law giving the present and all future state civil service commissioners overlapping terms of six years each and increasing the salaries of all three commissioners to \$5,000 each. This act also repeals the amendment to the law passed last year which removed secretaries to civil service commissions from the class of employees whose exemption is mandatory and makes all secretaries once more necessarily exempt. The Association, while favoring the principle of overlapping terms for commissioners, opposed this bill in committee and before the Governor as containing no proper provision for removal, as unduly increasing the salaries of all commissioners and thus unnecessarily adding to the expense of civil service administration, and because of its provision as to secretaries of civil service commissions.

NEW YORK CITY

In the municipal service Mayor Gaynor's Commission has continued to give its warm support to the merit principle, and is entitled to high praise for its honest, thorough enforcement of the law. On December 31 Mr. Creelman, who has been president of the Commission since May, 1911, resigned. Of the unusually efficient and able conduct of his office which marked Mr. Creelman's term this Committee has already expressed its high appreciation. His retirement from membership in the Commission was a distinct and genuine loss to the city. He was succeeded by Mr. Frank Gallagher, who had been for many years an expert per diem examiner in the office of the Commission and who thus brought to the place he now holds the benefit of long experience with the details of civil service administration.

THE POLICE DEPARTMENT

The investigations into conditions in the police department, and particularly that conducted by the Aldermanic committee, have borne directly on the question of the examination into the character of candidates for the police force as conducted by the Civil Service Commission. Shortly after Mr. Creelman became president, and following the dismissal of Police Commissioner Cropsey for illegally passing over three names in succession in making new appointments to the force, the bureau of character investigation in the police department was abolished and the Civil Service Commission undertook to do its work. Evidence brought out at the hearings before the Aldermanic committee indicated that the Commission had been extremely careless in this important part of its work, certifying for appointment candidates with bad records and a large number who had been guilty of deceit and fraud in their applications.

The Association's Committee on Administration undertook a thorough investigation into the matter. The investigation showed some surprising and dis-

quieting facts. No sufficient appropriation to employ the necessary number of investigators had been made and the Commission had therefore assigned several monitors to act as investigators, though the monitors are non-competitive employees, while the investigators are competitive. The Commission had qualified, without question and without having before it even the essential facts of the candidate's record, those whom the investigating bureau stated were of satisfactory character. But more important than this was the fact that the Commission had in numerous cases qualified men who were lacking in an essential element of character, namely, the ability to tell the truth. The false statements which were made under oath had to do commonly with arrests, and were made either in the original application sheet, in the blank filled out for the investigating bureau or in both. Out of candidates on the list examined, 135 lied in both the application and character sheets. Of these 135, 107 were actually qualified by the Commission, in spite of the fact that here the false statements must have been deliberate. In several cases of false statements about arrests the charges were far from trivial, involving, e. g., felonious assault, stealing, fighting, disorderly conduct, and presence in a poolroom which was raided. Eleven candidates were qualified who had been discharged by railway companies for failure to register fares.

The report of this investigation was submitted to the Commission by the Committee on Administration with a letter of comment, in which the Committee said in part:

"A man in such a position, who has charge of the lives and property of the citizens of New York, with the ability and apparent disposition to swear away both if occasion requires, exercises a greater power for evil than almost any other officer in the civil service, and the police administration of this city has, we conceive, a reasonable right to be excused for many of the severe criticisms which are now being passed upon it, if it is forced to employ candidates certified to it by your Commission whose character upon a

preliminary investigation has been shown to be so questionable as appears in the records recited in our report, and who have made false statements under oath in connection with their examination."

To this letter, sent after President Creelman's resignation, Commissioners Welling and Keogh replied, expressing themselves as "in entire agreement with the sentiments . . . as to the importance of truthfulness, especially in the case of applicants for the police force," and stating that the Commissioners were in hearty accord with the suggestion that this matter be treated with the greatest vigilance. Since that time a new eligible list for patrolmen has been established, from which a number of appointments have been made. The Committee on Administration has had this list also examined and is glad to report that there has been a marked toning up of the Commission's conduct of its work. The bureau of investigation still lacks sufficient appropriation properly to do its work and monitors and others are assigned to it whose qualifications have not been sufficiently tested. The Commission now has, however, a statement of essential facts in regard to all candidates whom the bureau recommends as of satisfactory character. It has become, furthermore, much more rigid in its action on cases of candidates who have denied arrests. Out of a list of 161 names investigated by the Committee, 134 were qualified, 25 disqualified, and action on 2 not yet taken. Of the 134 qualified, 4 denied arrests in application sheets but admitted them in their character sheets, 1 denied an arrest occurring after the filing of papers, and 4 denied arrests in both papers. Of the 4 who denied arrests in both papers, the qualification of 2 seems entirely without justification. In one of the other two cases the candidate acknowledged two arrests but denied one which occurred in 1901 at the age of nine. The other was arrested, according to the police records, in 1903 at the age of 14 on a charge of petit larceny, but in a careful cross-examination testified that he had not been served with a warrant and had gone to the station house with his

mother on the advice of other persons, and had been discharged.

This Committee believes that the Commission cannot be too strict in insisting on absolute fidelity to truth of all candidates for patrolman, and that it should therefore regard it as an automatic bar to appointment if it appears that a candidate has been guilty of any deviation from the truth whatsoever. On the other hand, candidates who tell the truth and admit arrests for trivial misdemeanors which any city boy is likely to commit and which are offset by a good employment record may properly be qualified. That the Commission has set a higher standard of late is gratifying, and if continued should serve as a guarantee that the character of the men appointed to the police force will be of high quality. The Committee holds, however, that the police commissioner, like the head of every other department, is not relieved of the responsibility of seeing to it so far as he can that only fit men are appointed permanently. He is given authority at the end of the probationary period to dismiss summarily any member of the force whose character and record are found to be bad or whose unfitness or incompetence is shown in actual service. The probationary period is the part of the examination in which the appointing officer takes part. He should regard it as his duty to perform that function conscientiously and well.

THE FIRE PREVENTION BUREAU

The committee of the Board of Aldermen to whom was referred the petition of several organizations asking for an investigation into the appointment of the temporary inspectors in the bureau of fire prevention failed to act thereon after a long hearing held last July, in which this Association took part. The competitive examination for the position of inspector was delayed until the end of December by a suit brought to test the right of the Commission to set a minimum age limit above 21 for entrance into the examination, but

the Court of Appeals upheld the Commission in its power to set such conditions and the examination was thereupon held. At the last moment another attempt was made to prevent the holding of the test, but through the energy of President Creelman the attempt was foiled. The eligible list was finally established on April 16, and appointments made on May 1. Mandamus proceedings to compel the Commission to set aside the list have been brought on the ground that the examination was unfairly conducted, several of the candidates, it is alleged, having received their papers some time after the others. It is interesting to note that while most, if not all, the temporary inspectors, who were political appointees, went into the examination, only six secured a place on the eligible list.

DELAY IN EXAMINATIONS

The Committee on Administration has also made an investigation into the general work of the Commission during the past year. Its report shows an increase in the number of meetings held from 77 in 1911 to 91 in 1912, and a steady increase in the amount of examination work. But four special exceptions from examination for appointment to competitive positions were made—an extremely good record—but in one or two of those cases the Committee believes that an examination should have been insisted upon. In the important matter of promptly holding examinations and establishing eligible lists for positions for which there are vacancies but no lists the Commission has failed to make any noticeable improvement. In many cases over a year has been allowed to elapse between the date when the first temporary appointment was made and the date when a list was established and permanent appointment made possible. The Commission offers as the reason for these long delays a lack of sufficient appropriation. Undoubtedly the appropriations have been too small, but certain improvements could be made, and are, we are given to understand, in fact already contemplated, which will facili-

tate the examining work. The Commission, furthermore, has received this year considerable increases in appropriations for the examining division and the evil of long continued delays of the sort mentioned should be materially abated this year.

THE RESIDENCE ORDINANCE

The Board of Aldermen within the last few weeks passed an ordinance requiring all employees of the city to be residents and citizens of the state and to live within the city limits. The ordinance is understood to be directed especially at employees living in New Jersey, but its effects would be seriously to handicap the city in securing the services of experts of high qualifications for many of the city's important pieces of work. The Association, together with a number of other organizations, urged the Mayor to veto the measure, and it has since been recalled. It was, however, passed on April 29 in an amended form, which is but a slight improvement of the original ordinance. Such a provision of law is backward and vicious, and it is to be hoped will not be approved by Mayor Gaynor.

The Association's Law Committee, in addition to its work on legislation, has taken part in important litigation affecting the civil service law. Through Mr. Ordway, its chairman, and Mr. Albert de Roode, one of its members, it prepared a brief in the case of *People ex rel. Moriarty vs. Creelman*, involving the right of the Commission to set a minimum age limit above 21 in the examination for fire prevention inspector, and the brief was filed with the Court of Appeals. The result of the suit was to uphold the power of the Commission, thus establishing an important principle and precedent for the future.

On July 16 Mr. Elliot H. Goodwin, for over 12 years Secretary of the Association, resigned to take the important position of General Secretary to the Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America. Mr. Goodwin's services to the cause of

civil service reform and the work of this Association were tireless and invaluable, and in leaving the work he carried with him the high regard and affectionate esteem of every member of this Committee. He was succeeded in the secretaryship by Robt. W. Belcher, who had served as an assistant secretary since 1910. Mr. George T. Keyes became First Assistant Secretary and in October Mr. Harry W. Marsh was appointed Second Assistant Secretary.

The total membership of the Association numbers 890. Of these 16 are life members and 71 sustaining members.

In conclusion the Committee thanks the Women's Auxiliary for the support they have given the work of the Association and expresses its appreciation of their activity for civil service reform along independent lines. It also thanks the members of all standing and special committees for the time and attention which they have so cheerfully given to the work.

Respectfully,

SAMUEL H. ORDWAY,
Chairman.

ROBT. W. BELCHER,
Secretary.

APPENDIX

The Work of the State Civil Service Commission.

New York, April 22, 1913.

The Honorable the State Civil Service Commission
Albany, N. Y.

Gentlemen:

The Committee of this Association, appointed at the instance of the Governor to confer with you from time to time concerning the administration of the civil service law, begs to bring to your consideration the results of an examination of the records of the State Civil Service Commission during the past year, in so far as they affect your work since the date of your appointment on January 1st last. This examination was made with your consent by a representative of the Association at the direction of the Association's Committee on Administration. We feel compelled to confess that we are much disturbed at these results, and were it not that we feel confident that you will be disposed to reform the attitude towards the administration of the merit system which they indicate, we should have felt it important to acquaint the Governor and the public with them immediately. They have been considered by the Executive Committee of the Association and by its direction are respectfully transmitted to you.

The records show that you have held some thirty meetings during the past three months. This is an unusually large number of meetings for such a short time, and indicates that you are giving much time to the details of the Commission's work.

In the matter of classification of positions under your jurisdiction we find that 21 positions have been placed in the exempt class since January 1. For a number of these exemptions we believe that there was no valid excuse, and that several requests for exemption have been granted on the ground that the positions were confidential in character when, as a matter of fact, the argument appears to have been unsound. This is true of such positions as file and index clerk in the executive department, confidential record clerk and confidential examiner in the audit bureau, comptroller's office, and stenographer to the state athletic commission, confidential mortgage tax examiner and first assistant cashier in the New York office of the department of excise. The question of classification is one of the most important with which you have to deal. Failure to take a firm stand in favor of competition wherever practicable is sure to invite wholesale requests for exemptions.

In certain important details the records indicate that your administration has been extremely lax to say the least. We believe that a continuance of this policy in these matters can only result in badly discrediting the merit system in this state. The following cases are, in our opinion, particularly open to this criticism:

Some time ago the position of chief of accounts, office of the commissioner of agriculture, became vacant. There was one assistant chief of accounts—Miss Elizabeth A. Dowd—eligible for promotion. Under the rules Miss Dowd could not be promoted to be chief of accounts without passing a non-competitive promotion examination. This she refused to do. The commissioner of agriculture asked that she be promoted without an examination and the request was granted, you deciding that "no formal examination in this case" was necessary. In other words, a subordinate in one of the state departments refused to comply with the rules established by the Civil Service Commission and succeeded in having the rule set aside for her benefit.

Another case of an even more surprising character

is that of one Joseph A. Gannon, recently promoted from messenger at \$800 a year to clerk at \$1,200 a year in the office of the county clerk of Kings County. Gannon was originally a laborer in the office of the county clerk, but under a most remarkable application of the law and rules your predecessors permitted his appointment as a messenger in the competitive class without requiring him to pass an examination on the ground that the position of messenger was one calling for "peculiar and exceptional qualifications of a scientific, professional or educational character," that this laborer was a "person of high and recognized attainments in such qualities," and that the position of messenger could not in this case be filled through a competitive examination. Having got him into a competitive position in this manner, the county clerk wished to promote him to clerk, increasing his salary \$400. You directed that Gannon be given a non-competitive examination in accordance with the rule, since there were less than three persons qualified to compete. Gannon took this examination on January 29, 1913, but failed to pass, making a very poor showing. At the request of the county clerk and by your direction, however, Gannon was re-examined on March 1, 1913, only to fail again, receiving a general average of but 58.8 per cent. The fact that Gannon failed was reported to you by your chief examiner, whereupon you voluntarily raised his rating from 58.8 per cent. to 75 per cent. and declared him qualified for the promotion. There nowhere appears in the record any evidence to show on what ground this re-rating was authorized by you and we find it hard to believe that your examiners could have made an error of 16.2 per cent. in marking the papers.

In acting upon appeals for re-rating of papers in examinations we find a number of cases in which you have raised the marks given by your examiners so as to bring the candidate among the first three and permit his appointment; that in so doing you have set aside the judgment of your expert examiners for your own and have (inasmuch as apparently the papers of the

other candidates were not coincidentally re-examined) done gross injustice to other successful candidates; and in some cases you have given credit for experience gained by persons appointed provisionally without a competitive examination pending the establishment of an eligible list. Procedure of this character tends to raise and fortify a popular opinion that the civil service law is not honestly but is politically administered, and to discourage worthy applicants from entering the examinations. Why should they do so, when they find their success in standing gives them no guarantee of appointment? The following cases are in point:

John J. Hartnett was appointed stenographer in the Erie County lodging house after a non-competitive examination pending the establishment of an eligible list. He entered the competitive examination and secured a rating of 70.74 per cent. This percentage was raised to 75.10 per cent., and he was given a place on the eligible list. Later you decided that Hartnett should be given an additional allowance for experience gained while employed as the provisional appointee. His general average was therefore raised from 75.10 per cent. to 76.10 per cent., his position on the eligible list was changed from No. 5 to No. 3, and he was given a permanent appointment on February 22, 1913.

R. B. Somerville was appointed on October 1, 1912, after a non-competitive examination as chief clerk in the office of the state engineer and surveyor pending the establishment of an eligible list. Somerville entered the examination, attained a general average of 80.80 per cent., and was No. 16 on the list as established February 3, 1913. On February 8 Somerville appealed for a re-rating. Your chief examiner reported against granting his appeal, but on March 7 we find his rating on correspondence and filing was raised from 78 per cent. to 90 per cent., on canal laws from 85 per cent. to 95 per cent., and on education and experience from 80 per cent. to 88 per cent., increasing his general average from 80.80 per cent. to 88.49 per

cent., and changing his position from No. 16 on the list to No. 3. Within a few days Mr. Somerville received the permanent appointment.

In an examination for court crier I. F. McDermott was given a general average by the examiner of 93.15 per cent. By your action his rating was changed to 95 per cent., and his position on the eligible list was changed from No. 11 to No. 3, thus making possible his immediate appointment.

Edward J. Reilly, a candidate for promotion to record clerk in the court of general sessions, New York City, was given a rating of 90.85 per cent. by the examiners. This rating you increased to 91.75 per cent., changing his standing on the list from No. 5 to No. 3.

E. A. Neylan took the examination for court attendant on March 28, 1911. He was given a general average by the examiners of 94.20 per cent. He appealed to your predecessors for a re-rating, but this appeal was denied. He recently made a similar appeal to you, and you increased his mark to 95.86 per cent., changing his position on the list from No. 7 to No. 1. This appeal was granted, as in the Somerville case, against the advice of your chief examiner.

In the cases which we have cited we believe that you have exercised undue and unjustifiable liberality. It should be an established principle that no appeal for a re-rating will be granted unless it is shown that there has been a manifest error in marking or rating. The discretion and judgment of the examiners in rating papers should, in other words, be final. The original marking was without knowledge of the identity of the candidate and is presumptively honest. A re-rating is made with knowledge of identity and is usually influenced thereby. Moreover, if the Commission is to substitute its judgment for the judgment of the examiner and change the rating of one candidate, it should examine the papers of every other candidate and rate them on the same basis. Where, as in the case of Somerville, you find that there was an error in judgment by the examiners of as much as 8 per cent., it is a fair presumption that similar errors of judgment

were made in the cases of the other candidates in the same examination and that they should all be given the same benefit as that given the one candidate who appeals. It is most unfair to give an arbitrary additional credit to a provisional appointee because of the experience which he has had while serving temporarily. Provisional appointments are usually made for personal or political reasons. The candidate in an examination who has been serving temporarily gains a distinct advantage over the other candidates because of the knowledge of the duties of the position which he thus obtains. To give him additional credit merely because he has been serving in the position is to place the other candidates at a still greater disadvantage, and to make it comparatively easy for the head of the department to give a permanent appointment to the person whom he picks out in the first instance for the temporary appointment. This was exactly what happened in the case of Somerville, and the practice is one which is generally condemned, and which the New York City Commission, as well as many other commissions, has forbidden in its rules.

Another matter of much importance has to do with your policy in permitting appointments to competitive positions without requiring a competitive examination under the provisions of paragraph 5 of rule 8. This is the rule which permits the Commission to waive competition in the case of a single individual where the position to which appointment is made is one "demanding peculiar and exceptional qualifications of a scientific, professional or educational character," and where the Commission has "satisfactory evidence that for specified reasons competition in such special case is impracticable, and that the position can best be filled by the selection of some designated person of high and recognized attainments in such qualities. . . ." It is manifest that this rule should be applied only in rare and exceptional cases. Not only must the position be a peculiar one and the person an expert, but it must be proved that competition is not practicable. It appears from the records that you have permitted

appointments under this rule in eleven cases, the list of appointments including such positions as a court messenger at \$1,800, a chief of division of accounts and supplies at \$1,500, a special agent, department of agriculture, at \$5 a day, and a general inspector under the fiscal supervisor of charities. Not only does it seem that competition was entirely practicable for filling these places, but in several instances it stretched the rule to call the persons appointed persons of high and recognized attainments, or the positions such as call for peculiar and exceptional qualifications of a scientific, professional or educational character.

Alfred May, for example, who was appointed under this rule as a special agent in the department of agriculture, had been, according to the records and evidence submitted to you, a meat inspector in the New York City service and an examining inspector in the finance department. In October, 1912, he was appointed a laborer in the department of agriculture at \$60 a month, but was soon after given an appointment as a special agent without passing a competitive examination to perform temporary and occasional services under the provisions of rule 8, section 9. The present commissioner of agriculture desired to continue May's services in connection with the enforcement of the pure food law and at his request, although there was an eligible list in existence at the time from which an appointment could have been made, you declared that competition was impracticable in this case and that Mr. May was a person of "high and recognized attainments."

Another case coming under this rule is that of Thomas J. Tully. Mr. Tully was appointed a clerk in the register's office, New York County, in January, 1898, at a salary of \$1,200. On February 20, 1912, he was transferred to the surrogate's office, where he was given the title of chief examiner of the recording department and received a salary of \$1,500. One of the surrogates desired to promote him to the position of court messenger at \$1,800, and a special exception was therefore requested. In this case you declared that

a person holding a clerical position possessed "high and recognized attainments" in the qualifications required for the position of messenger, which qualifications were declared to be "peculiar and exceptional," and "of a scientific, professional or educational character."

Still another illustration is that of Cornelius F. Coughlin, appointed assistant chief examiner, brokers bureau, insurance department, at \$3,500. The records show that the commissioner of insurance stated to you that the assistant chief examiner was to have charge of work in the upper part of New York state, with headquarters at Buffalo, in connection with the investigation and granting of licenses to insurance brokers. He stated that this was a position coming within the provisions of paragraph 5 of rule 8 and gave as evidence of Mr. Coughlin's high and recognized attainments the statement that he was for "many years an honored member of the Assembly in this state, in which body he made a worthy record for faithful and efficient services. He has a wide knowledge of men and has expressed a willingness to undertake the present work."

Another appointment of this character was that of E. A. McAllister, appointed chief of division of accounts and supplies at \$1,800 in the office of the commissioner of records, New York County. Mr. McAllister was at the time of his appointment a record clerk in the office of the commissioner of records. The evidence submitted to show that Mr. McAllister was a person of "high and recognized attainments" was the statement that "Mr. McAllister is a certified public accountant; no other employee has such training." As proof of the impracticability of competition it was stated that competition was impracticable because "the duties of the position require technical knowledge and special knowledge of conditions which exist only in this department." The facts are, however, that the chief of the division of accounts and supplies was called on to install a unit cost plan in the department and take care of detailed monthly reports ordered by the

commissioner of accounts. The position could be filled by a certified public accountant, and there is not the slightest difficulty in holding a competitive examination for such a position. As a matter of fact, accountants doing more important work than that required of the chief of division of accounts and supplies in the office of the commissioner of records are regularly appointed from a competitive eligible list in New York City.

Respectfully yours,

(Signed) SAMUEL H. ORDWAY,
EVERETT P. WHEELER,
NELSON S. SPENCER,
ANSLEY WILCOX,
ROBT. W. BELCHER,
Special Committee.

New York, May 2, 1913.

Hon. William Sulzer,
Governor of the State of New York,
Executive Chamber, Albany, N. Y.

Dear Sir:

On April 22 the special committee of this Association appointed at your suggestion to confer with the State Civil Service Commission on matters affecting the administration of the civil service law sent to the Commission a letter based on an examination of the minutes of the meetings of the Commission and commenting on the Commission's work since its appointment on January 1. Although this letter contained statements of facts which, in the opinion of the special committee, showed, to say the least, extreme laxity of administration in several important particulars, the Commission has not as yet favored the committee with the courtesy of a reply.

We are much concerned at this fact, particularly in view of a request from the Commissioner of Labor for the exemption of 28 positions in his department which is to be considered at a meeting on May 5, and with relation to which the committee has had no assurance

that the Commission would not look upon the request with the same leniency as it has considered other requests and matters.

We, therefore, take the liberty of transmitting to you herewith copy of the letter referred to and respectfully ask that you give the matter your personal attention.

Respectfully yours,
(Signed) SAMUEL H. ORDWAY,
Chairman.

ROBT. W. BELCHER,
Secretary.

For the Special Committee.

May 6, 1913.

State of New York,
Executive Chamber, Albany.

Mr. Robert W. Belcher, Secretary, Civil Service Reform Association, 79 Wall Street, New York City.

My Dear Mr. Belcher:

Your letter duly received and contents carefully noted. You can rely on me to give my personal attention and earnest consideration to all that you say. Will take these matters up with Commission and do everything in my power to carry out your suggestions.

With best wishes, believe me as ever,

Very sincerely your friend,

(Signed) WM. SULZER.

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE TREASURER.

MAY 1, 1913.

Balance on hand May 1, 1912\$ 30.56

RECEIPTS:

| | | |
|--|------------|----------|
| From Annual Dues..... | \$3,350.00 | |
| “ Sustaining Membership Dues..... | 1,650.00 | |
| “ Subscriptions | 580.00 | |
| “ Extra Dividend of 14 2/7%, Title Guarantee & Trust Company.... | 228.57 | |
| “ From Sale of 2-2/7 Shares Stock, Title Guarantee & Trust Company.... | 960.00 | |
| “ Women’s Auxiliary..... | 100.00 | |
| “ Title Guarantee & Trust Company, In- terest on Elial F. Hall Bequest... | 384 00 | 7,252.57 |

DISBURSEMENTS:

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|------------|------------|
| Salary of Secretary | \$1,750.04 | |
| “ “ Assistant Secretary..... | 937.50 | |
| “ “ Second Assistant Secretary..... | 550.00 | |
| Salaries of Clerks | 1,236.41 | |
| Expenses of Litigation..... | 31.50 | |
| Expenses of Annual Meeting..... | 20.00 | |
| Legislative Information..... | 150.00 | |
| Office Expenses..... | 139.27 | |
| Office Rent..... | 550.00 | |
| Postage and Stamped Envelopes..... | 450.64 | |
| Printing..... | 362.00 | |
| Stationery | 135.30 | |
| Subscription to GOOD GOVERNMENT..... | 532.60 | |
| Telephone Service..... | 103.81 | |
| Travelling Expenses..... | 106.80 | |
| Subscription to National League..... | 207.30 | 7,263.17\$ |

Balance on hand..\$ 19.96*

E. & O. E.

A. S. FRISSELL, *Treasurer.*

§ Of which \$1,088.01 was in payment of liabilities carried over from year ending April 30, 1912.

* On May 1, 1913, there were bills due and unpaid to the amount of \$516.88, leaving an actual deficit of \$496.92.

ELIAL F. HALL FUND.

Held as a special deposit at the Fifth Avenue Bank, certificate No. 5844 for sixteen shares Title Guarantee & Trust Company stock.

The above stock pays dividends of 20% per annum, namely \$320.

A. S. FRISSELL, *Treasurer.*

The above account examined and found correct.

New York, May 14, 1913.

NICHOLAS KELLEY, }
THOMAS D. THACHER, } *Auditing Committee*

ORGANIZATION
OF
THE NEW YORK CIVIL SERVICE REFORM
ASSOCIATION

CONSTITUTION.

ARTICLE I.

The name of this organization shall be The Civil Service Reform Association.

ARTICLE II.

The object of the Association shall be to establish a system of appointment, promotion, and removal in the civil service, founded upon the principle that public office is a public trust, admission to which should depend upon proven fitness. To this end the Association will demand that appointments to subordinate executive offices, with such exceptions as may be expedient, not inconsistent with the principle already mentioned, shall be made from persons whose fitness has been ascertained by competitive examinations open to all applicants properly qualified, and that removals shall be made for legitimate cause only, such as dishonesty, negligence, or inefficiency, but not for political opinion or refusal to render party service; and the Association will advocate all other appropriate measures for securing integrity, intelligence, efficiency, good order, and due discipline in the civil service.

ARTICLE III.

The Association will hold meetings, raise funds, publish and circulate appropriate information, correspond and co-operate with associations organized elsewhere for the objects set forth in this Constitution, and support all executive and legislative action which promote its purposes.

ARTICLE IV.

The conditions of membership shall be wholly independent of party preference. Questions shall not be discussed in the debate or in the publications of the Association upon party grounds. Neither the name nor influence of the Association shall be used on behalf of any party, or for procuring office or promotion for any person. But nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent the Association from opposing any candidate when in its opinion, or in that of three-fourths of the members of the Executive Committee, such course is demanded by the objects of the Association.

ARTICLE V.

There shall be a President, to be elected by the Association at the annual meeting, who shall perform the usual and prescribed duties of that office. He shall be, ex-officio, a member of all committees, with a casting vote only, and he may call special meetings of the Executive Committee whenever he thinks it necessary, and, with the assent of two members of the Executive Committee, special meetings of the Association.

There shall be ten Vice-Presidents, to be annually elected by the Association.

There shall be a Treasurer and Secretary and such other officers as the Executive Committee may from time to time designate, who shall perform the usual and prescribed duties of such officers. They shall be respectively appointed by the Executive Committee, and may be removed by them. The Treasurer shall be, ex-officio, a member of the Finance Committee of the Association.

There shall be an Executive Committee of twenty-five members, to be elected annually by the Association. Subject to these articles, the Executive Committee shall manage the affairs of the Association, direct and dispose of its funds, and from time to time make and modify by-laws for the Association and for its own action. The Executive Committee shall keep a record of its proceedings, and shall make a report to the Association at the annual meeting. No appropriation of

money by the Executive Committee beyond the amount in the hands of the Treasurer at the time shall bind any member of the Association, excepting those members of the Executive Committee who shall vote for it. Vacancies in the Executive Committee may be filled by the President for the remainder of the term. Other vacancies may be filled by the Executive Committee.

All the officers of the Association and members of the several Standing Committees shall be, ex-officio, members of the Executive Committee.

ARTICLE VI.

Each officer of the Association shall continue to hold office until his successor has been selected and is ready to enter upon the duties of the office.

ARTICLE VII.

There shall be an annual meeting of the Association on the second Wednesday of May, at which officers shall be elected for the ensuing year, and other appropriate business may be transacted; except in the year 1898, when the annual meeting shall be held on the second Wednesday of January.

ARTICLE VIII.

Any person may be proposed in writing for membership by any member of the Association, and shall be admitted upon approval of the Executive Committee. Members failing to pay their dues may be dropped from the roll by the Executive Committee.

ARTICLE IX.

The annual dues of each member shall be \$5, payable on the 1st of May, and each member shall receive the annual report and all other publications of the Association. Sustaining members, on payment of twenty-five dollars annually, and Life members, exempt from annual dues on payment of one hundred dollars, may be elected by the Executive Committee at any regular meeting thereof.

ARTICLE X.

All provisions of this Constitution, except those relating to the rights of members, and the term of officers, may be suspended or amended by a vote of two-thirds of the Executive Committee, subject to the approval of the Association by a two-thirds vote of the members present either at the annual meeting or at a special meeting duly called. Due notice shall be given before any such annual or special meeting that the approval of the Association will, thereat, be asked for such action of the Executive Committee, and the notice shall clearly state the effect of such suspension or amendment in the text of the Constitution. Any member of the Association may propose amendments to the Constitution, which may be approved under the same conditions.

BY-LAWS.

FOR THE GOVERNMENT OF THE ASSOCIATION AND ITS COMMITTEES.

§ 1. The Annual meeting of the Association shall be held at such hour and place as the Executive Committee shall designate. The election of officers shall be by ballot, but any member not present may declare his vote by letter to the Secretary and it shall be counted.

§ 2. The meetings of each committee, unless otherwise especially provided for, shall be at half-past eight P. M., at which time the chairman shall direct the call of the names of its members and the Secretary shall record the names of those present and others as they appear.

§ 3. The order of business, before each committee shall be :

1. The reading and correction of the records of the last meeting.

And, thereafter, unless otherwise ordered, as follows :

2. Any statement due from the Treasurer.
3. Unfinished business from the last meeting.
4. Report from the Secretary's office.
5. Reports of standing committees.
6. Reports of special committees.
7. Proposals of new members and their election.
8. Miscellaneous business.

§ 4. Regular meetings of the Executive Committee shall be held on the second Wednesday of every month except July and August, but if that day be a holiday, then on the third Wednesday. Ten members of the Executive Committee shall constitute a quorum.

§ 5. Neither in the meetings of the Association nor of any committee shall any member speak more than once on any motion nor more than ten minutes at one time, without unanimous consent, nor shall any person, or his actions, be characterized on party grounds.

§ 6. Special meetings of any committee may be called by its chairman or by any three members, and due notice thereof shall be given by the Secretary.

§ 7. All notices to a member shall be sent to his address^s filed with the Secretary.

§ 8. On the demand of one-fifth of the members present^s at any meeting of the Association or of a committee, the ayes and nays shall be called and recorded on any motion.

§ 9. All committees shall be appointed by the chair unless their selection shall be otherwise provided for.

§ 10. At each regular meeting of the Executive Committee, it shall be the duty of the Treasurer to make a statement of the amount of money in the treasury and of the place of its deposit, and, at the annual meeting, he shall state the source of all moneys received and the use made of the same during the past year.

§ 11. The Secretary shall keep a record of the proceedings^s of the Association and of the Executive Committee, and perform the other duties assigned him.

§ 12. Without the consent of three-fourths of the members present, no vote which will declare or fill a vacancy or elect a member of the Association shall be deemed carried, at the same meeting in which it was first moved.

§ 13. It shall require a vote of two-thirds of the members of the Executive Committee present to pass any vote under which more than \$100 will be appropriated or the Association be pledged for more than that amount, and the Executive Committee alone shall have authority to create any charge upon the funds of the Association. But neither said committee nor any officer or officers of the Association shall be authorized to create a personal liability against any members but themselves.

§ 14. There shall be the following Standing Committees, of seven members each, which shall be selected annually by the Executive Committee:

(1) A Finance Committee, whose duty it shall be to devise and carry into effect, subject to the direction of the Executive Committee, suitable measures for raising funds, and to supervise and report upon the income and expenditures of the Association. The Chairman of the Executive Committee shall, in advance of each annual meeting of the Association, appoint an Auditing Committee from among the members of the Association, whose duty it shall be to examine all vouchers and audit the accounts of the Treasurer, and to report thereon at the annual meeting.

(2) A Publication Committee, whose duty it shall be to prepare and recommend matters suitable for publication by the Association, and to take charge of the printing and distribution of whatever may be ordered printed.

(3) A Committee on Correspondence, whose duty it shall be to promote the objects of the Association through correspondence and co-operation with other organizations.

(4) A Committee on Administration, whose duty it shall be to investigate and report upon the administration of the civil service law and rules and to consider and recommend suitable methods of examination for admission to and promotion in the public service, and suitable procedure tending to make the system more efficient.

There shall also be a Standing Committee on Law of nine members, which shall be selected annually by the Executive Committee. Its duty shall be to consider all legislation affecting the civil service, to promote such as may be approved, and to oppose such as may be disapproved by the Executive Committee, and to prepare and recommend such amendments to the law as in their opinion will advance the purposes of the Association. The Law Committee shall have power to represent the Association in any legal proceedings which may be necessary in order to maintain or enforce the laws affecting the State or Municipal civil service.

There shall also be a Standing Committee on Membership

of fifteen members, which shall be selected annually by the Executive Committee. Its duties shall be to devise and carry into effect measures for increasing the membership of the Association.

Each Standing Committee shall be competent to fix the number of its own quorum; but such quorum shall in no case be less than three.

§ 15. These By-Laws may be amended, or new By-Laws added, by a four-fifths vote at any meeting of the Executive Committee; or by a two-thirds vote, provided a statement of the proposed change had been entered on the minutes at the last meeting.

§ 16. Amendments proposed under the last clause of the tenth section of the constitution shall be first submitted to the Executive Committee.

STANDING COMMITTEES.

FINANCE:

| | |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------|
| ALFRED BISHOP MASON, <i>Chairman.</i> | ALFRED B. MEACHAM |
| CHARLES A. CONANT | ISAAC N. SELIGMAN |
| A. S. FRISSELL, <i>ex-officio</i> | SAMUEL THORNE, JR. |
| | HORACE WHITE |

PUBLICATION:

| | |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------|
| EDWARD CARY, <i>Chairman.</i> | SAM A. LEWISOHN |
| H. A. CUSHING | FRANCIS D. POLLAK |
| CHARLES J. FAY | WILSON M. POWELL, JR. |
| | JOHN A. SLEICHER |

CORRESPONDENCE:

| | |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| ELBRIDGE L. ADAMS, <i>Chairman.</i> | CHARLES W. McCANDLESS |
| ALBERT S. BARD | NATHAN A. SMYTH |
| WILLIAM M. CHADBOURNE | CORNELIUS B. SMITH |
| | WALTER F. TAYLOR |

ADMINISTRATION:

| | |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| NELSON S. SPENCER, <i>Chairman.</i> | RUSSELL H. LOINES |
| ELLWOOD HENDRICK | JOHN R. MUNRO |
| FRANCIS H. KINNICUTT | CLARENCE BISHOP SMITH |
| | WILLIAM MASON SMITH |

LAW:

| | |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| SAMUEL H. ORDWAY, <i>Chairman.</i> | JOSEPH P. COTTON, JR. |
| HENRY DE FOREST BALDWIN | ALBERT DE ROODE |
| CHARLES C. BURLINGHAM | A. LEO EVERETT |
| WILLIAM M. COLEMAN | J. WARREN GREENE |
| | HENRY W. HARDON |

MEMBERSHIP:

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------|
| CHARLES BURLINGHAM, <i>Chairman.</i> | NICHOLAS KELLEY |
| CHARLES WHITNEY DALL | FRANKLIN B. LORD |
| H. E. DREIER | LEONARD G. McANENY |
| B. H. FANCHER | ROBT. H. NEILSON |
| ALAN FOX | EDGAR L. SMITH |
| JEROME D. GREENE | WILLIAM H. TAFT, 2nd |
| HERBERT L. GUTTERSON | THOMAS D. THACHER |
| | ROGER H. WILLIAMS |

OFFICERS—1913-1914.

PRESIDENT:

EVERETT P. WHEELER

VICE-PRESIDENTS:

| | |
|-----------------|-----------------------|
| CHARLES COLLINS | ELIHU ROOT |
| DAVID H. GREER | FRANCIS LYNDE STETSON |
| ABRAHAM JACOB | ANSON PHELPS STOKES |
| WILLIAM G. LOW | OSCAR S. STRAUS |
| LEVI P. MORTON | HORACE WHITE |

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE:

| | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| SAMUEL H. ORDWAY, <i>Chairman</i> | J. WARREN GREENE |
| HENRY DE FOREST BALDWIN | HENRY W. HARDON |
| GEORGE R. BISHOP | RUSSELL H. LOINES |
| ROSCOE C. E. BROWN | ALFRED BISHOP MASON |
| CHARLES C. BURLINGHAM | PHILIP J. MCCOOK |
| EDWARD CARY | JOHN G. MILBURN |
| GEORGE P. CHRISTIE | LUDWIG NISSEN |
| JOSEPH P. COTTON, JR. | CARL L. SCHURZ |
| JONATHAN C. DAY | ISAAC N. SELIGMAN |
| HORACE E. DEMING | NELSON S. SPENCER |
| A. LEO EVERETT | WILLIAM H. THOMSON |
| A. S. FRISSELL | CHARLES W. WATSON |

SECRETARY:

ROBT. W. BELCHER

ASSISTANT SECRETARIES

GEORGE T. KEYES
HARRY W. MARSH

TREASURER:

A. S. FRISSELL

MEMBERSHIP ROLL.

SUSTAINING MEMBERS.

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| BEHR, HERMAN, | 75 Beekman Street, New York City |
| BLISS, WILLIAM H., | 6 East 65th Street, " " " |
| BURLINGHAM, CHARLES C., | 27 William Street, " " " |
| CARY, EDWARD, | The "Times," New York City |
| CHUBB, PERCY, | Glen Cove, L. I. |
| CLYDE, WILLIAM P., | 24 State Street, New York City |
| COCHRAN, ALEX. SMITH, | 10 East 41st Street, " " " |
| COLEMAN, WILLIAM M., | 60 Broadway, " " " |
| COLLINS, CHARLES, | 133 E. 36th Street, " " " |
| CURTIS, W. J., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| CUTTING, R. FULTON, | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| DAY, WILLIAM S., | 220 Hobart Avenue, Summit, N. J. |
| DE COPPET, E. J., | 42 Broadway, New York City |
| DEERING, JAMES, | Fullerton and Clybourne Avenues, Chicago, Ill. |
| DE LAMAR, J. R., | 43 Exchange Place, New York City |
| DELANO, WARREN Jr., | 1 Broadway, " " " |
| DENISON, WINFRED T., | Department of Justice, Washington, D. C. |
| FINCH, EDWARD R., | 37 Fifth Avenue New York City |
| FLEITMAN, FRED T., | 484 Broome Street, " " " |
| FORD, JAMES B., | 4 E. 43rd Street, " " " |
| FRISSELL, A. S., | 530 Fifth Avenue, " " " |
| FROTHINGHAM, JOHN W., | 5 Nassau Street, " " " |
| GOODMAN, A. L., | 136 W. 87th Street, " " " |
| GOODWIN, ELLIOT H., | 707 Riggs' Bldg., Washington, D. C. |
| GOODWIN, J. J., | 11 W. 54th Street, New York City |
| GREENE, J. WARREN, | 111 Broadway, " " " |
| GREENFIELD, GEORGE J., | 32 Broadway, " " " |
| HARRIOT, S. CARMAN, | 125 W. 58th Street, " " " |
| HEMENWAY, AUGUSTUS, | 10 Tremont Street, Boston, Mass. |
| HENTZ, HENRY, | 769 St. Mark's Avenue, Brooklyn |
| ISELIN, ADRIAN, JR., | 711 Fifth Avenue, New York City |
| JACOBI, A., | 19 E. 47th Street, " " " |
| LOINES, STEPHEN, | 152 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn |
| LOW, SETH, | 30 E. 64th Street, New York City |
| LOW, WILLIAM G., | 58 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| LUSTGARTEN, WILLIAM, | 68 William Street, New York City |
| MACY, V. EVERIT, | 68 Broad Street, " " " |
| MARTIN, BRADLEY, Jr., | 6 E. 87th Street, " " " |
| MASON, ALFRED BISHOP, | 6 Wall Street, " " " |
| MINTURN, ROBERT SHAW, | 116 E. 22d Street, " " " |
| MORTON, LEVI P., | 38 Nassau Street, " " " |
| MUSCHENHEIM, WILLIAM C., | Hotel Astor, New York City |

| | | | | | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|---|---|
| McANENY, GEORGE, | | 19 E. 47th Street, New York City | | | |
| McKIM, JOHN A., | | 6 E. 74th Street, | " | " | " |
| ORDWAY, SAMUEL H., | | 27 William Street, | " | " | " |
| OSBORN, WILLIAM CHURCH, | | 71 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| PAGENSTECHER, A., | | P. O. Box 683, | " | " | " |
| PAYNE, GEORGE E., | | 251 Nott Avenue, Long Island City | | | |
| PERKINS, GEORGE W., | | 71 Broadway, New York City | | | |
| PHIPPS, HENRY, | | 6 E. 87th Street, | " | " | " |
| PIERCE, H. CLAY, | | 25 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| PUTNEY, EDMONDS, | | 2 Rector Street, | " | " | " |
| READ, WILLIAM A., | | 25 Nassau Street, | " | " | " |
| ROBINSON, NELSON, | | 23 E. 55th Street, | " | " | " |
| ROSSBACH, LEOPOLD, | | 42 E. 75th Street, | " | " | " |
| RUSSELL, CHARLES H., | | 15 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| SCHEFER, CARL, | | 476 Broome Street, | " | " | " |
| SCHIFF, JACOB H., | | P. O. Box 1193, | " | " | " |
| SELIGMAN, ISAAC N., | | 1 William Street, | " | " | " |
| SMITH, CORNELIUS B., | | 405 Park Avenue, | " | " | " |
| SPENCER, NELSON S., | | 27 William Street, | " | " | " |
| SPEYER, JAMES, | | 257 Madison Avenue, | " | " | " |
| STETSON, FRANCIS LYNDE, | | 15 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| STOKES, ANSON PHELPS, | | 100 William Street, | " | " | " |
| STOWELL, HARLEY L., | | 96 Broadway. | " | " | " |
| THOMSON, WILLIAM H., | | 70 E. 54th Street, | " | " | " |
| THORNE, SAMUEL, | | 19 Cedar Street, | " | " | " |
| VANDERBILT, HAROLD S., | Grand Central Terminal, | " | " | " | " |
| VOSS, F. G., | | 123 Pall Mall, London, S. W., England | | | |
| WATSON, CHARLES W., | | 500 Madison Avenue, New York City | | | |
| WHITE, ALFRED T., | | 14 Wall Street, | " | " | " |
| WHITE, HORACE, | | 18 W. 69th Street, | " | " | " |
| WUNDERLICH, F. W., | | 8 Sidney Place, Brooklyn | | | |

| | |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Abbot, Everett V., | 45 Cedar Street, New York City |
| Abbott, Lyman, | 287 Fourth Avenue, " " " |
| Achelis, John, | 68 Leonard Street, " " " |
| Adams, Edward D., | 71 Broadway, " " " |
| Adams, Elbridge L., | 299 Broadway, " " " |
| Adams, Joseph, | Union Stock Yards, Chicago, Ill. |
| Adams, Thatcher M., | 36 Wall Street, New York City |
| Addinsell, H. M., | 56 William Street, " " " |
| Adler, Felix, | 152 W. 77th Street, " " " |
| Affeld, Francis O., | 873 President Street, Brooklyn |
| Agar, John G., | 31 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Allen, Calvin H., | 1 W. 72nd Street, " " " |
| Allen, Franklin, | 371 Fulton Street, Brooklyn |
| Alling, Joseph T., | 400 Oxford Street, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Allison, Charles R., | 60 Wall Street, New York City |
| Alsop, Reese F., | 96 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| Ambrose, John F., | New Rochelle, N. Y. |
| Ames, John McE., | 165 Broadway, New York City |
| Anderson, Frank E., | 486 Broadway, " " " |
| Andrews, J. Sherlock, | 111 St. Paul Street, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Arend, F. J., | 165 Broadway, New York City |
| Armstrong, James, | 71 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Armstrong, S. T., | Milburn Farms, Katonah, N. Y. |
| Atterbury, Grosvenor, | 20 W. 43rd Street, New York City |
| Auchincloss, John, | 27 Pine Street, " " " |
| Avery, Samuel P., | 61 Woodland Street, Hartford, Conn. |
| Babbott, Frank L., | 346 Broadway, New York City |
| Backus, Grosvenor H., | Englewood, N. J. |
| Bacon, Selden, | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Bagley, Valentine N., | 641 Washington Street, " " " |
| Baker, William F., | 379 Washington Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Baldwin, Henry de Forest, | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Baldwin, William D., | 175 W. 58th Street, " " " |
| Bangs, L. Bolton, | 32 E. 51st Street, " " " |
| Bannard, Otto T., | 24 Broad Street, " " " |
| Bard, Albert Sprague, | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Barkley, C. B., | 23 W. 58th Street, " " " |
| Barnes, Henry B., Jr., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Barney, A. H., (Life) | 101 E. 38th Street, " " " |
| Barrett, John D., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Bartlett, P. G., | 62 Cedar Street, " " " |
| Baruch, Bernard M., | 111 Broadway, " " " |
| Battle, George Gordon | 37 Wall Street, " " " |
| Bausch, J. J., | 13 Hyde Park, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Bausch, William, | 745 St. Paul Street, " " " |
| Baylies, Edmund L., | 54 Wall Street, New York City |
| Beekman, Gerard, | 7 E. 42d Street, " " " |
| Beer, Edwin, | 48 W. 74th Street, " " " |
| Beer, George Lewis, | 329 W. 71st Street, " " " |
| Beers, E. Le Grand, | 131 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| Beers, Lucius H., | 49 Wall Street, New York City |

| | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| Belcher, Robt. W., | 79 Wall Street, New York City |
| Bell, Gordon Knox, | 22 William Street, " " " |
| Bellamy, Frederick P., | 204 Montague Street, Brooklyn |
| Bennecke, Henry, | 219 Congress Street, Brooklyn |
| Bernard, William, | 149 Broadway, New York City |
| Betts, Samuel R., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Bijur, Nathan, | 160 West 75th Street, " " " |
| Binker, R. S., | City Club, " " " |
| Bird, Francis W., | 101 E. 70th Street, " " " |
| Bishop, George R., | 142 E. 18th Street, " " " |
| Blagden, Arthur C., | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Boas, Franz, | Columbia University, " " " |
| Bodman, Herbert L., | 835 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Borkel, John, | 42 E. Houston Street, " " " |
| Bowker, R. R., | 298 Broadway, " " " |
| Bowler, R. P., | 2 Rector Street, " " " |
| Brachhausen, G. A., | Rahway, N. J. |
| Brackett, George C., | 50 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| Bradbury, Harry B., | 141 Broadway, New York City |
| Bradt, Herbert S., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| Brady, William H., | 559 W. 26th Street, " " " |
| Briesen, Arthur von, (Life) | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Brown, Addison, | 45 W. 89th Street, " " " |
| Brown, Edwin H., | 141 Broadway, " " " |
| Brown, Franklin Q., | 33 Pine Street, " " " |
| Brown, Roscoe C. E., | 164 Hicks Street, Brooklyn |
| Brown, Thatcher M., | 1024 Park Avenue, Plainfield, N. J. |
| Brownell, William C., | 153 Fifth Avenue, New York City |
| Brush, W. Franklin, | 500 Fifth Avenue, " " " |
| Bulkley, Edwin M., | 54 William Street, " " " |
| Bulkley, Johathan, | 75 Duane Street, " " " |
| Burlingham, Charles, | 27 William Street, " " " |
| Burr, George L., | Hartley Hall, Columbia University, " " " |
| Burr, Winthrop, | 7 Wall Street, " " " |
| Butler, Howard R., | 131 E. 66th Street, " " " |
| Buttfield, William J., | 96 Wall Street, " " " |
| Byrne, James, | 26 Broad Street, " " " |
| Cadwalader, John L., | 40 Wall Street, " " " |
| Cahen, I. J., | 1 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Campbell, John A., | New Cumberland, West Va. |
| Canfield, George F., | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Carey, Samuel, | 170 Broadway, " " " |
| Carnegie, Andrew, (Life) | 2 E. 91st Street, " " " |
| Carroll, Lauren, | 2 Wall Street, " " " |
| Carter, Ernest T., | 150 W. 58th Street, " " " |
| Cassatt, George M., | 327 Broadway, " " " |
| Cauldwell, S. Millbank, | Scarsdale, N. Y. |
| Cerf, L. A., | 135 Broadway, New York City |
| Chadbourne, William M., | 32 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Chaffee, J. Irwin, | Sedgwick Avenue, Fordham Heights, " " " |
| Chaplin, Duncan D., | 817 Broadway, " " " |

| | |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Chapman, John Jay, | 60 Wall Street, New York City |
| Chase, George, | 174 Fulton Street, " " " |
| Chauncey, Daniel, | 129 Joralemon Street, Brooklyn |
| Chauncey, Elihu, | 208 Madison Avenue, New York City |
| Childs, Edwards H., | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Chilton, Forrest S., | 26 Court Street, Brooklyn |
| Choate, Joseph H., | 60 Wall Street, New York City |
| Choate, Joseph H. Jr., | 60 Wall Street, " " " |
| Choate, William G., | 40 Wall Street, " " " |
| Christie, George P., | 1926 E. 14th Street, Brooklyn |
| Cillis, Hubert, | 20 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Clafin, John, | 224 Church Street, " " " |
| Clark, Grenville, | 500 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Clarkson, Banyer, | 26 W. 50th Street, " " " |
| Clay, George E., | 9 Jackson Avenue, Long Island City |
| Clement, Arthur W., | 150 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Cleveland, Treadwell, | 27 William Street, " " " |
| Clinch, Edward S., | 41 Park Row, " " " |
| Codington, Perley M., | 1487 Broadway, " " " |
| Coffin, C. A., | 30 Church Street, " " " |
| Coffin, I. Sherwood, | 30 Cliff Street, " " " |
| Cohen, William N., | 22 William Street, " " " |
| Colby, Bainbridge, | 111 Broadway, " " " |
| Coleman, Edwin S., | 17 Battery Place, " " " |
| Coley, William B., | 40 East 41st Street, " " " |
| Collord, George W., | 260 West 73rd Street, " " " |
| Collins, Atwood, | Asylum Avenue, Hartford, Conn. |
| Collins, Minturn Post, | 1 W. 34th Street, New York City |
| Collins, Stephen W., | 63 Wall Street, " " " |
| Colton, Henry E., | Dept. of Justice, Washington, D. C. |
| Conant, Charles A., | 38 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Conner, Lewis A., | 53 E. 49th Street, " " " |
| Conrad, W. Davis, | 2 Rector Street, " " " |
| Cook, Walter, | 3 W. 29th Street, " " " |
| Cooley, Alford Warriner, | Mountain Park, N. M. |
| Copeland, Henry C., | 242 W. 101st Street, New York City |
| Cornell, Edward, | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Corning, C. R., | 36 Wall Street, " " " |
| Corrigan, Joseph E., | 52 W. 9th Street, " " " |
| Corwine, William R., | 13 Astor Place, " " " |
| Cotton, Joseph P., Jr., | 14 Wall Street, " " " |
| Coudert, Frederick R., Jr., | 2 Rector Street, " " " |
| Cowperthwait, Arthur N., | 1925 Seventh Avenue, " " " |
| Cowperthwait, J. Howard, | 195 Park Row, " " " |
| Coxe, Macgrane, | 50 Church Street, " " " |
| Coykendall, S. D., | Rondout, N. Y. |
| Crandall, Floyd M., | 113 W. 95th Street, New York City |
| Crane, Frederick, | Dorset, Vt. |
| Crane, Leroy B., | 277 Broadway, New York City |
| Cranford, Walter V., | 190 Montague Street, Brooklyn |
| Cravath, Paul D., | 52 William Street, New York City |

| | |
|---------------------------|--|
| Crawford, Gilbert H., | 32 Liberty Street, New York City |
| Crocker, W. T., | 143 E. 35th Street, " " " |
| Croly, Herbert D., | 11 E. 24th Street, " " " |
| Cromwell, Frederic, | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Cromwell, Lincoln, | 1 Greene Street, " " " |
| Croswell, J. G., | 17 W. 44th Street, " " " |
| Curtis, F. Kingsbury, | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Curtis, Warren, Sr., | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Curtis, William E., | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Cushing, H. A., | 43 Cedar Street, " " " |
| Cushing, William E., | Society for Savings Bldg., Cleveland, O. |
| Cutting, R. Bayard, | 32 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Dall, C. Whitney, | 44 Leonard Street, " " " |
| Damrosch, Frank, | 181 East 75th Street, " " " |
| Dana, Charles A., | 55 West 51st Street, " " " |
| Dana, Charles L., | 53 W. 53rd Street, " " " |
| Dana, Richard H., Jr., | 331 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Davidge, William H., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Davies, J. Clarence, | 149th Street and 3rd Avenue, " " " |
| Davies, Juli T., | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Davis, G. Pierrepont, | Woodland Street, Hartford, Conn, |
| Davis, Horace A., | 118 E. 28th Street, New York City |
| Davison, Charles Stewart, | 60 Wall Street, " " " |
| Day, Clarence S., | 45 Wall Street, " " " |
| Day, Jonathan C., | Labor Temple, 14th Street and 2d Avenue, " " " |
| de Coppet, H., | 754 Park Avenue, " " " |
| DeForest, R. W., | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Deming, Horace E., | 13 William Street, " " " |
| Demorest, William C., | 60 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Derby, James Lloyd, | 925 Park Avenue, " " " |
| deRoode, Albert, | 52 Wall Street, " " " |
| Devine, Thomas J., | 19 Portsmouth Terrace, Rochester, N. Y. |
| DeWitt, Theodore, | 88 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Dickson, James B., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Dittenhoefer, A. J., | 96 Broadway, " " " |
| Dodd, Lee W., | 257 W. 86th Street, " " " |
| Dodge, Cleveland H., | 99 John Street, " " " |
| Dommerich, L. F., | 57 Greene Street, " " " |
| Dorr, Goldthwaite H., | 71 Broadway, " " " |
| Dougherty, J. Hampden, | 27 William Street, " " " |
| Dows, Tracy, | Room 102, Produce Exchange, " " " |
| Dreier, H. E., | 253 Thirty-sixth Street, Brooklyn |
| Drescher, William, A. E., | c. o. Bausch & Lomb, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Drew, John, | Racquet and Tennis Club, New York City |
| Driggs, Laurence, | 135 Broadway, " " " |
| Drucklieb, Charles A., | 14 Park Place, " " " |
| Dunham, Edward K., | 338 E. 26th Street, " " " |
| Dunning, S. Wright, | 420 Riverside Drive, " " " |
| Dutcher, Charles M., | 248 Sixth Avenue, " " " |
| Dwight, Edmund, | 56 Maiden Lane, " " " |
| Eastman, George, | 400 East Avenue, Rochester, N. Y |

| | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Eaton, Henry W., | 80 William Street, New York City | | |
| Eliot, Charles W., | Cambridge, Mass. | | |
| Elliot, Daniel G., | 77th Street and 8th Avenue, New York City | | |
| Ely, Arthur H., | 56 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Ely, Robert E., | 23 West 44th Street, | " | " |
| Emmons, Arthur B., | 1515 Massachusetts Avenue, Washington, D. C | | |
| Erbe, Gustav, | 344 St. Paul Street, Rochester, N. Y. | | |
| Erbslöh, R., | Box 16, Station A, New York City | | |
| Estes, Webster C., | 74 Warren Street, | " | " |
| Evans, George, | 55 West 39th Street, | " | " |
| Evans, Selah O., | 118 W. Houston Street, | " | " |
| Everett, A. Leo, | 37 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Ewart, Richard H., | 115 Franklin Street, | " | " |
| Ewing, Thomas, Jr., | 67 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Fabbri, Alessandro, | 11 E. 62d Street, | " | " |
| Fabbri, Ernesto G., | 11 E. 62d Street, | " | " |
| Fairchild, Benjamin T., | P. O. Box 1120, | " | " |
| Fairchild, Charles S., | Cazenovia, N. Y. | | |
| Fancher, B. H., | 21 Ridgeview Avenue, White Plains, N. Y. | | |
| Farley, Terence | 40 E. 83rd Street, New York City | | |
| Fay, Charles J., | 14 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Ferguson, William C., | Garden City, New York | | |
| Ferry, Mansfield | 31 Nassau Street, New York City | | |
| Field, Hamilton E., | 106 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn | | |
| Fish, Sidney W., | 25 East 78th Street, New York City | | |
| Fischer, H., | 1016 Lexington Avenue, | " | " |
| Fletcher, Henry | 165 Broadway, | " | " |
| Folks, Homer, | 105 E. 22nd Street, | " | " |
| Foster, Hugh M., | 501 W. 121st Street, | " | " |
| Foster, Macom G., | P. O. Box 1120, | " | " |
| Fox, Alan, | 50 Pine Street, | " | " |
| Fox, Austen G., (Life), | 37 E. 39th Street, | " | " |
| Francis, C. D., | 60 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Frankenheimer, John, | 25 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Frankfort, M., | C 22 Produce Exchange, | " | " |
| Frankfurter, Felix, | War Department, Washington, D. C. | | |
| French, Daniel E., | 125 W. 11th Street, New York City | | |
| Fries, William A., | 4819 Fourth Avenue, Brooklyn | | |
| Fuld, Leonard Felix, | 130 E. 110th Street, New York City | | |
| Fuller, Paul, | 2 Rector Street, | " | " |
| Fullerton, Alexander, (Life), | 5 W. 8th Street, | " | " |
| Gaillard, William D., | 42 Broadway, | " | " |
| Gallagher, Patrick, | 1181 Broadway, | " | " |
| Garver, John A., | 44 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Gasser, Roy C., | 35 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Gattell, Beno B., | 253 W. 72nd Street, | " | " |
| Germond, H. S., | 44 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Gerrish, Frank Scott, | 17 E. 76th Street, | " | " |
| Getzelsohn, J. A., | 1259 Longfellow Avenue, | " | " |
| Gibbons, George W., | 198 Broadway, | " | " |

| | | | | |
|--------------------------|-----------|--|---|------------|
| Gilbert, Cass, | | 11 E. 24th Street, New York City | | |
| Gilliss, Walter, | | 150 Fifth Avenue, | " | " |
| Glenn, John M., | | 136 E. 19th Street, | " | " |
| Goadby, Clarence, | | 21 W. 35th Street, | " | " |
| Godkin, Laurence, | | 36 W. 10th Street, | " | " |
| Goetze, Otto, | | 60 Remsen Street, Brooklyn | | |
| Goldman, Julius, | | 31 Nassau Street, New York City | | |
| Goldmark, James, | | 83 Warren Street, | " | " |
| Goldwater, A. L., | | 141 W. 121st Street, | " | " |
| Goodnow, Frank J., | | 49 Riverside Drive, | " | " |
| Goodrich, David M., | | 2 Rector Street, | " | " |
| Goodwin, H. L., | | 170 Broadway, | " | " |
| Gottheil, Paul, | | 8-10 Bridge Street, | " | " |
| Gottsberger, Francis, | | 156 Broadway, New York City | | |
| Gould, Elgin R. L., | | 15 W. 38th Street, | " | " |
| Grant, De Forest, | | 22 E. 49th Street, | " | " |
| Grant, Percy S., | | 7 W. 10th Street, | " | " |
| Gray, Henry G., | | 161 Madison Avenue, | " | " |
| Green, Horace | | The Evening Post, 20 Vesey Street, | " | " |
| Green, Noah, | | 478 Central Park, West, | " | " |
| Greene, Jerome D., | | 875 Park Avenue, | " | " |
| Greenough, John, | | 38 E. 63rd Street, | " | " |
| Greer, David H., | | 7 Gramercy Park, | " | " |
| Gregory, E. C., | | 54 W. 47th Street, | " | " |
| Griswold, William E. S., | | 37 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Gunther, J. J., | | 48 E. 81st Street, | " | " |
| Guthrie, William D., | | 44 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Gutterson, Herbert L., | | 49 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Gwynne, Arthur C., | | | | Rye, N. Y. |
| Hall, Thomas C., | | 700 Park Avenue, New York City | | |
| Halsey, Robert H., | | 158 W. 58th Street, | " | " |
| Halsted, John F., | | 93 Remsen Street, Brooklyn | | |
| Hamlin, Frank H., | | Canandaigua, N. Y. | | |
| Hammond, John Henry, | | 40 Wall Street, New York City | | |
| Hand, Learned, | | U. S. Dist. Court Chambers, P. O. Bldg., | " | " |
| Hand, O. K., | | 526 W. 122d Street, | " | " |
| Hand, Richard L., | | Elizabethtown, N. Y. | | |
| Hansmann, Carl A., | | 96 Broadway, New York City | | |
| Harbeck, Charles T., | | 306 Lexington Avenue, | " | " |
| Hard, Anson W., | | 107 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Harding, Edward, | | 43 Exchange Place, | " | " |
| Hardon, Henry Winthrop, | | 60 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Hare, Montgomery | | 109 E. 64th Street, | " | " |
| Harrison, Robert L., | | 59 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Hart, John Wilson, | | District Attorney's Office, | " | " |
| Hasslacher, Jacob, | | 100 William Street, | " | " |
| Haupt, Louis, | | 232 E. 19th Street, | " | " |
| Hayes, J. Noble, | | 68 William, | " | " |
| Hayman, Jacob, | | 195 Edgecomb Avenue, | " | " |
| Healy, A. Augustus, | | 198 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn | | |
| Heath, Frank E., | | 95 Liberty Street, New York City | | |

| | | | | | |
|-------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|---|---|
| Heckscher, A., | | 576 Fifth Avenue, New York City | | | |
| Heimann, Julius, | | 315 W. 105th Street, | " | " | " |
| Heinze, Arthur P., | | 31 Nassau Street, | " | " | " |
| Henderson, Harold G., | | 80 Irving Place,, | " | " | " |
| Hendrick, Ellwood, | | 139 E. 40th Street, | " | " | " |
| Hentz, Leonard S., | | 769 St. Mark's Avenue, | Brooklyn | | |
| Herbert, William, | | 11 Pine Street, | New York City | | |
| Herrick, W. W., | | 50 E. 53rd Street, | " | " | " |
| Hess, Alfred F., | | 154 W. 72nd Street, | " | " | " |
| Hess, Selmar, | | 151 W. 25th Street, | " | " | " |
| Hewlett, Mortimer C., | | 900 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| Hildreth, P. S., | | 15 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| Hinkley, Samuel Neilson, | | | Lawrence, L. I. | | |
| Hinrichs, Frederick W., | | 76 William Street, | New York City | | |
| Hitchcock, Welcome G., (Life) | | 69 E. 11th Street, | " | " | " |
| Hobart, Henry L., | | 120 Front Street, | " | " | " |
| Hodges, Harrison B., | | 16 Gramercy Park, | " | " | " |
| Hoe, Richard M., | | Room 102, Produce Exchange, | " | " | " |
| Holt, Henry, | | 34 W. 33rd Street, | " | " | " |
| Holt, Roland, | | 34 W. 33rd Street, | " | " | " |
| Hooper, Parker Morse, | | 15 West 38th Street, | " | " | " |
| Hoppin, Frederick S., | | 29 Waverly Place, | " | " | " |
| Hoppin, William W., | | 54 William Street, | " | " | " |
| Hornblower, William B., | | 24 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| Horsey, Outerbridge, | | 153 East 37th Street, | " | " | " |
| Howe, J. Morgan, | | 12 W. 46th Street, | " | " | " |
| Howe, Wirt, | | 135 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| Howell, Wilson S., | | 80th Street, East End Avenue, | " | " | " |
| Howland, Charles P., | | 35 Wall Street, | " | " | " |
| Hoyt, Allen G., | | 49 Wall Street, | " | " | " |
| Hoyt, Francis D., | | 69 Wall Street, | " | " | " |
| Hubbard, Thomas H., | | 16 W. 58th Street, | " | " | " |
| Hughes, Charles E., | | | Washington, D. C. | | |
| Hull, Charles A., | | 95 William Street, | New York City | | |
| Hulse, Frederick, | | 31 Nassau Street, | " | " | " |
| Hunt, Leavitt J., | | 165 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| Huntington, Francis C., | | 54 William Street, | " | " | " |
| Huntington, Samuel, | | 176 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| Hyde, A. F., | | 55 Liberty Street, | " | " | " |
| Hyslop, John, | 4 Riverview Terrace, | foot East 58th Street, | " | " | " |
| Ide, Robert L., | | 7 Nassau Street, | " | " | " |
| Ijams, J. Horton, | | 56 William Street, | " | " | " |
| Ingraham, Edward, | | 69 Worth Street, | " | " | " |
| Insley, Robert B., | | | Westfield, N. J. | | |
| Ireland, F. G., | | 299 Broadway, | New York City | | |
| Ireland, John B., | | 104 E. 43rd Street, | " | " | " |
| Iselin, C. Oliver, | | 36 Wall Street, | " | " | " |
| Iselin, John H., | | 25 Broad Street, | " | " | " |
| Isham, Samuel, | | 471 Park Avenue, | " | " | " |
| Jackson, John G., | | 71 Broadway, | " | " | " |
| Jackson, Percy, | | 43 Cedar Street, | " | " | " |

| | | | |
|--|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Jacob, Lawrence, | 68 Broad Street, New York City | | |
| Jacobson, Samuel A., | 132 Nassau Street, " " " | | |
| James, Henry, Jr., | 12 W. 44th Street, " " " | | |
| James, Walter B., | 17 W. 54th Street, " " " | | |
| Jameson, E. C., | 76 William Street, " " " | | |
| Jaretzki, Alfred, | 49 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Jay, William, | 48 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Jellenik, Felix, | 111 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Jennings, Frederick B., | 15 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Jennings, Percy H., | 25 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Johnson, Burges, | 3 E. 14th Street, " " " | | |
| Johnson, Robert Underwood, | 33 E. 17th Street, " " " | | |
| Johnson, Willis Fletcher, | 154 Nassau Street, " " " | | |
| Joline, Adrian H., | 54 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Jones, Oliver Livingston, Jr., | 116 W. 72d Street, " " " | | |
| Josephthal, Sidney L., | 19 Cedar Street, " " " | | |
| Kahn, Otto H., (Life), | 54 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kelley, Nicholas, | 52 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kellogg, Francis B., | Temple Auditorium, Los Angeles, Cal. | | |
| Kelsey, Clarence H., | 146 Broadway, New York City | | |
| Kenneson, Thaddeus D., | 13 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kenyon, William Houston, | 49 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Keppler, Rudolph, | 25 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Kernan, John D., |, Utica, N. Y. | | |
| Kernochan, J. Frederic, | 44 Pine Street, New York City | | |
| Keyes, E. L. Jr., | 109 E. 34th Street, " " " | | |
| Keyes, George T., | 79 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Kidder, Camillus G., | 27 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kiernan, Patrick, | 14 E. 83rd Street, " " " | | |
| Kilbreth, James T., | 45 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Kilmer, Alfred G., | 15 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kimball, A. R., |, Orange, N. J. | | |
| King, Le Roy, | 20 E. 84th Street, New York City | | |
| Kinnicutt, Francis H., | 165 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Kinnicutt G Herman, | 39 E. 35th Street, " " " | | |
| Kirchhoff, Charles, | 585 Riverside Drive, " " " | | |
| Klein, Isaac H., | 105 William Street, " " " | | |
| Knapp, James R., | P. O. Bldg., " " " | | |
| Knapp, Shepherd, | 8 Institute Road, Worcester, Mass. | | |
| Knauth, Antonio, | 39 West 76th Street, New York City | | |
| Knauth, Theodor W., | 15 William Street, " " " | | |
| Koehler, Jerome H., | 47 Cedar Street, " " " | | |
| Kohler, Max J., | 52 William Street, " " " | | |
| Kudlich, Herman C., | 233 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Kuehnle, Frederick C., | 460 E. 141st Street, " " " | | |
| Kunhardt, William B., | 100 Broadway, New York City | | |
| Kunstlich, Samuel H., | 198 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Laimbeer, Francis E., | 299 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Lambert, William B., | Highland Street, Cambridge Mass. | | |
| Landes, Leonard, | 140 E. 22nd Street, New York City | | |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Landsman, S. M., | 220 E. 19th Street, New York City |
| Langmann, G., | 121 W. 57th Street, " " " |
| Lansing, J. Townsend, | 82 State Street, Albany, N. Y. |
| Lansingh, Van Rensselaer, | 6523 Euclid Avenue, Cleveland, Ohio |
| Larremore, Wilbur, | 32 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Lawrence, John Burling, | 136 E. 30th Street, " " " |
| Leavitt, John Brooks, | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Leaycraft, J. Edgar, | 19 W. 42nd Street, " " " |
| Lederle, Ernest J., | 471 W. 143d Street, " " " |
| Ledoux, Albert R., | 99 John Street, " " " |
| Lee, Frederick S., | 125 E. 65th Street, " " " |
| Lee, Henry T., | 54 W. 52nd Street, " " " |
| Lee, W. H. L., | 45 Pine Street, " " " |
| Leech, Robinson, | 94 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| Leffingwell, R. C., | 52 William Street, New York City |
| Le Gendre, William, | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Lehmaier, James M., | 215 E. 22nd Street, " " " |
| Lehmaier, Louis A., | 78 Beekman Street, " " " |
| Leonard, William D., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| LeRoy, E. A., | 200 West 57th Street, " " " |
| Levi, Albert A., | 52 Broadway, " " " |
| Lewis, Richard V., | 130 W. 42d Street, " " " |
| Lewisohn, Sam A., | 42 Broadway, " " " |
| Liberman, Joel B., | 16 E. 40th Street, " " " |
| Lichtenstein, Paul, | 304 W. 78th Street, " " " |
| Lieberman, Walter H., | 32 Broadway, " " " |
| Lindsay, Alexander M., | 373 East Avenue, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Littauer, Lucius N., | Gloversville, N. Y. |
| Livingston, Goodhue, | 38 E. 65th Street, New York City |
| Loines, Russell H., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Lomb, Adolph, | 289 Westminster Road, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Lomb, Henry C., | 281 Barrington Street, " " |
| Lord, Franklin B., | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Lord, Frederic W., | 126 E. 65th Street, " " " |
| Low, Josiah O., | 37 Wall Street, " " " |
| Ludington, A. C., | 56 W. 10th Street, " " " |
| Ludlow, James B., | 45 Cedar Street, " " " |
| Lusk, William C., | 47 E. 34th Street, " " " |
| Luther, George Martin, | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Lyman, Frank, | 88 Wall Street, " " " |
| Lyman, Theodore, | Woodland Street, Hartford, Conn. |
| Lynch, J. De P., | Utica, N. Y. |
| Macfarlane, Wallace, | 32 Liberty Street, New York City |
| MacKellar, George M., | 43 Cedar Street, " " " |
| MacVeagh, Charles, | 15 Broad Street, " " " |
| MacKenzie, James C., | Dobbs Ferry, N. Y. |
| Mallet-Prevost, Severo, | 30 Broad Street, New York City |
| Mallinckrodt, Edward, | Mallinckrodt Chemical Works, St. Louis, Mo. |
| Mansfield, Howard, | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Marble, Charles B., | Waterboro, Me. |
| Marling, Alfred E., | 21 Liberty Street, New York City |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Marsh, Harry W., | 79 Wall Street, New York City |
| Marsh, Robert McC. | 45 West 11th Street, " " " |
| Marshall, Fielding L., | 73 East Elm Street, Chicago, Ill. |
| Marshall, Louis, | 37 Wall Street, New York City |
| Marsters, A., A., | 15 Dey Street, " " " |
| Martin, Alfred W., | 995 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Martin, John, | Grymes Hill, Staten Island, N. Y. |
| Martin, T. Comerford, | 29 West 39th Street, New York City |
| Mason, Alexander T., | 13 William Street, " " " |
| Mathews, Robert, | 135 Spring Street, Rochester, N. Y. |
| Matthew, William B., | 319 W. 112th Street, New York City |
| Matthews, Brander, | 681 West End Avenue, " " " |
| Matthewson, Arthur, | South Woodstock, Conn. |
| Maxwell, William H., | 500 Park Avenue, New York City |
| May, Charles, | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Maynard, Walter E., | Fifth Avenue Building, " " " |
| Meacham, Alfred B., | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Mellen, Chase, | 27 Cedar Street, " " " |
| Merck, George, | Llewelyn Park, West Orange, N. J. |
| Merrill, Charles E., | 44 E. 23d Street, New York City |
| Merrill, Payson, | 31 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Metcalf, Manton B., | 45 E. 17th Street, " " " |
| Metcalf, Henry, | 147 Fourth Avenue, " " " |
| Metzger, B. F. | 4804 11th Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Milbank, Albert G., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Milburn, John G., | 54 Wall Street, " " " |
| Miller, Clifford L., | 62 West 89th Street, " " " |
| Miller, Daniel S., | 150 Central Park S., " " " |
| Miller, George Douglas, | 125 State Street, Albany, N. Y. |
| Mills, Ogden L., | 15 Broad Street, New York City |
| Mitchell, J. F. B., | 33 Pine Street, " " " |
| Moen, Edward C., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Moffat, R. Burnham, | 63 Wall Street, " " " |
| Montgomery, R. M., | 27 Pine Street, " " " |
| Morgan, W. Fellows, | Arch 11, Brooklyn Bridge, " " " |
| Morgan, W. Forbes, Jr., | 71 Broadway, " " " |
| Morris, Ray, | 14 Wall Street, " " " |
| Morrow, Dwight, | Englewood, N. J. |
| Morse, Horace J., | 820 St. Mark's Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Morse, Richard C., | 35 Sidney Place, " |
| Mortimer, Richard, | 11 Wall Street, New York City |
| Mosenthal, P. J., | 95 William Street, " " " |
| Mosle, A. Henry, | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Mott, William F., | Toms River, N. J. |
| Munro, J. G., | 61 Erie County Bank Building, Buffalo, N. Y. |
| Munro, John R., | 132 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| Munroe, Vernon, | 30 Church Street, New York City |
| Murphy, Charles Frederick | 50 Church Street, " " " |
| Murphy, Daniel F., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| Murray, Joseph K., | Broadway, opposite 16th Street, Flushing, N. Y. |
| McAlpin, George L., | 68 William Street, New York City |

| | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| McAneny, Leonard G., | 2 Rector Street, New York City |
| McCagg, Louis Butler, | 18 E. 84th Street, " " " |
| McCandless, Charles W., | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| McCobb, James S., | 44 W. 44th Street, " " " |
| McCook, Philip J., | 15 William Street, " " " |
| McGinness, Remsen, | Holly, Colo. |
| McKeever, J. Lawrence, | 164 Lexington Avenue, New York City |
| McMahon, Fulton, | 165 Broadway " " " |
| Nadal, Charles C., | 142 E. 35th Street, " " " |
| Nash, Arthur C, | 27 E. 22nd Street, " " " |
| Naumberg, Elkan, | 48 W. 58th Street, " " " |
| Neilson, Robert H., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Nelson, H. W., Jr., | Marshfield Hills, Mass. |
| Newton, Albro, J., | 528 Union Street, Brooklyn |
| Newton, R. Heber, | East Hampton, N. Y. |
| Nichols, George M., | 277 Adelphi Street, Brooklyn |
| Nichols, W. N., | 25 Broad Street, New York City |
| Nicoll, James C., | 51 W. 10th Street, " " " |
| Nissen, Ludwig, | 182 Broadway, " " " |
| Norris, Henry S., | 10 W. 49th Street, " " " |
| Norton, Algernon S., | 256 Broadway, " " " |
| Norton, Charles D., | 2 Wall Street, " " " |
| Notman, George, | 99 John Street, " " " |
| Oakes, Charles, | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| O'Connor, John A., | Box H. Tarrytown, N. Y. |
| Ogden, Charles W., | 14 E. 79th Street, New York City |
| Ogden, Rollo, | 20 Vesey Street, " " " |
| Olin, Stephen H., | 32 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Oltman, H. H., | 42 Broadway, " " " |
| Olyphant, Robert, | 17 Battery Place, " " " |
| Opdyke, William S., | 20 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Oppenheim, Edward L., | 111 Broadway, " " " |
| Oppenheimer, Henry S., | 5 E. 43rd Street, " " " |
| Orcutt C. Blake, | Hudson River Day Line, " " " |
| Ordway, Edward W., | 1093 Dean Street, Brooklyn |
| Orr, Alexander E., | 102 Remsen Street, " |
| Osborn, Perry, | 850 Madison Avenue, New York City |
| Osborne, Thomas M., | Auburn, N. Y. |
| Ottley, James H., | 236 West 37th Street. New York City |
| Paffard, Frederic C., | 238 Clinton Street, Brooklyn |
| Page, Edward D., | Oakland, N. J. |
| Page, Walter H., | 130 East 67th Street, New York City |
| Page, William H., | 32 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Parish, Edward C., | 52 Wall Street, " " " |
| Parker, Frederick S., | 32 Garden Place, Brooklyn |
| Parsons, Herbert, | 52 William Street, New York City |
| Parsons, John E., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Partridge, John N., | Hamilton Club, Brooklyn |
| Paulding, James Kirk, | 238 W. 70th Street, New York City |
| Peabody, George Foster, | Saratoga Springs, N. Y. |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Peck, William E. | 118 Broad Street, New York City |
| Pedersen, James, | 40 E. 41st Street, " " " |
| Pendleton, Francis K., | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Phillips, Louis S., | 49 Broadway, " " " |
| Phillips, N. Taylor, | 51 Chambers Street, " " " |
| Phoenix, Phillips, | 68 Broad Street, " " " |
| Pierce, Henry H., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| Pierrepont, Robert Low, | 140 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn |
| Pierson, James R., | 29 Broadway, New York City |
| Pinchot, Amos R. E., | 60 Broadway, " " " |
| Pinchot, Gifford, | 1615 Rhode Island Avenue, Washington, D. C. |
| Pinney, George M., | 32 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Planten, W. R. J., | 44 Eighth Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Plaut, Albert, | 120 William Street, New York City |
| Polk, W. M., | 7 E. 36th Street, " " " |
| Pollak, Francis D., | 49 Wall Street, " " " |
| Post, Abram S., | 81 Fulton Street, " " " |
| Potter, Alonzo, | 119 E. 54th Street, " " " |
| Potter, Frederick, | 71 Broadway, " " " |
| Potts, W. Rockhill, | 143 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Powell, Wilson M., Jr., | 29 Wall Street, " " " |
| Pratt, Frederic B., | 215 Ryerson Street, Brooklyn |
| Pratt, John T., | 43 Exchange Place, New York City |
| Prentice, William P., | 52 Broadway, " " " |
| Price, Joseph M., | 192 West Broadway, " " " |
| Proskauer, Joseph M., | 170 Broadway, " " " |
| Pryer, Charles, | New Rochelle, N. Y. |
| Putnam, George Haven, | 2 W. 45th Street, New York City |
| Putnam, George P., | 1170 Broadway, " " " |
| Putnam, Harrington, | 404 Washington Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Putnam, Irving, | 2 W. 45th Street, New York City |
| Putnam, J. Bishop, | 2, W. 45th Street, " " " |
| Pyle, James McAlpin, | 55 Wall Street, " " " |
| Pyne, Moses Taylor, | 30 Pine Street, " " " |
| Quereau, C. H., | Grand Central Terminal, " " " |
| Rabenold, Ellwood M., | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Rand, William H., Jr. | 39 Wall Street, " " " |
| Raven, A. A., | 51 Wall Street, " " " |
| Raymond, Rossiter W. | 25 W. 39th Street, " " " |
| Reed, Lansing P., | 15 Broad Street, " " " |
| Reichhelm, Edward P., | 90 West 34th Street, Bayonne, N. J. |
| Reid, Wallace, | 56 Maiden Lane, New York City |
| Reynolds, James B., | 151 Central Park West, " " " |
| Rhoades, John Harsen, | 66 Beaver Street, " " " |
| Rice, Edwin T., Jr., | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Richards, C. A. L., | 169 Power Street, Providence, R. I. |
| Richards, George, | 141 Broadway, New York City |
| Rives, George L., | 69 E. 79th Street, " " " |
| Robbins, Francis L., Jr., | 32 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Robinson, Beverly R., | 42 W. 37th Street, " " " |

| | |
|--|---|
| Robinson, Moncure, | 7 E. 42d Street, New York City |
| Rogers, Robert, | 48 E. 61st Street, " " " |
| Roome, W. Harris, | 2030 Broadway, " " " |
| Roosevelt, Franklin D., | War Dep't, Washington, D. C. |
| Roosevelt, Theodore, | Oyster Bay, N. Y. |
| Root, Elihu, | 733 Park Avenue, New York City |
| Rose, Arthur P., | Geneva, N. Y. |
| Rosendale, Simon W., | 57 State Street, Albany, N. Y. |
| Rosbach, Jacob, | 1 W. 86th Street, New York City |
| Rounds, Arthur C., | 96 Broadway, " " " |
| Rowe, Basil W., | 71 Broadway, " " " |
| Rowe, William V., | 133 E. 38th Street, " " " |
| Rublee, George, | 32 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Runyon, Carman R., | 87 Locust Hill Avenue, Yonkers, N. Y. |
| Rush, Thomas E., | 20 Exchange Place, New York City |
| Russell, Isaac Franklin, | Court Special Sessions, " " " |
| Russell, J. Townsend, | 220 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn |
| Ryan, Charles J., | 26 Court Street, " |
| Sachs, Walter E., | 60 Wall Street, New York City |
| Sackett, Henry W., | 154 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Salomon, William, | 25 Broad Street, " " " |
| Sand, Henry A. L., | 50 Pine Street, " " " |
| Sands, B. Aymar, | 31 Nassau Street, " " " |
| Sanger, William Cary, | Sangerfield, N. Y. |
| Sanger, W. Prentice | 331 Madison Avenue, New York City |
| Schafer, Samuel M., | 55 Wall Street, " " " |
| Scharmann, Hermann B., | 170 W. 59th Street, " " " |
| Schieffelin, William Jay, | 5 E. 66th Street, " " " |
| Schieren, Charles A., | 405 Clinton Avenue, Brooklyn |
| Schneidenbach, Arthur Jaques, | 75 E. 82d Street, New York City |
| Schrader, George H. F., | 32 Rose Street, " " " |
| Schurman, George W., | 15 W. 57th Street, " " " |
| Schurz, Carl Lincoln, | 45 Broadway, " " " |
| Schwarz, Herbert F., The Manchester, | 255 W. 108th Street, " " " |
| Schwarzenbach, Robert J. F., | 472 Broome Street, " " " |
| Schwarzschild, Monroe M., | 155 Riverside Drive, " " " |
| Scott, J. F., | 11 Overlook Street, Mount Vernon, N. Y. |
| Scribner, Arthur H., | 597 Fifth Avenue, New York City |
| Scribner, Charles, | 153 Fifth Avenue, " " " |
| Seaman, Louis L., | 247 Fifth Avenue, " " " |
| Seaver, Benjamin F., | 111 Pierrepont Street, Brooklyn |
| Sedgwick, Arthur G., | 52 William Street, New York City |
| Sedgwick, Ellery, | Brookline, Mass. |
| Sedgwick, Henry D., | 120 E. 22d Street, New York City |
| Seligman, E. R. A., | 324 W. 86th Street, " " " |
| Seligman, George W., | 3 S. William Street, " " " |
| Seligman, Jefferson, | 1 William Street, " " " |
| Serven, A. Ralph, | 1419 "F" Street, N. W., Washington, D. C. |
| Sexton, Lawrence E., | 34 Pine Street, New York City |
| Shainwald, Ralph L., | 100 William Street, " " " |
| Shaw, Albert, | 13 Astor Place, " " " |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|--|
| Sheldon, Edward W., | 45 Wall Street, New York City | | |
| Sheppard, John S., Jr., | 27 Cedar Street, " " " | | |
| Sibley, Harper, | 5 Nassau Street, " " " | | |
| Silverman, M. J., | 213 Alexander Avenue, " " " | | |
| Simes, William, | Box 3084, Boston, Mass. | | |
| Simon, Franklin, | 414 Fifth Avenue, New York City | | |
| Skidmore, William L., | 39 W. 52nd Street, " " " | | |
| Skuse, Thomas J., | Naval Office, Customs House, " " " | | |
| Slade, Francis Louis, | 115 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Sleicher, John A., | 225 Fifth Avenue, " " " | | |
| Slicer, Thomas R., | 55 W. 44th Street, " " " | | |
| Sloan, Benson B., | 38 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Small, A., | 20 Pike Street, " " " | | |
| Smillie, James C., | 440 West End Avenue, New York City | | |
| Smith, Adelbert J., | 15 William Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, Charles Robinson, | 25 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, Clarence B., | 27 William Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, E. E., | 50 E. 41st Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, Edgar L., | 115 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Smith, F. Hopkinson, | 150 E. 34th Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, Frederick J., | 32 Chambers Street, " " " | | |
| Smith, Howard M., | Brevoort Savings Bank, Brooklyn | | |
| Smith, James E., | 38 Park Row, New York City | | |
| Smith, James F., | 68 E. 86th Street, " " " | | |
| Smith J Waldo, | 165 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Smith, William Mason, | 25 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Smyth, Nathan A., | 60 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Snow, Elbridge G., | 56 Cedar Street, " " " | | |
| Snow, Frederick A., | 15 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Spackman, W. M., | 820 Madison Avenue, " " " | | |
| Spector, Joseph, | 241 E. 68th Street, " " " | | |
| Spence, Kenneth M., | Dept. of Justice, U. S. Atty's Office | | |
| Spiegelberg, Frederick, | 36 W. 76th Street, " " " | | |
| Spingarn, J. E., | 9 W. 73rd Street, " " " | | |
| Stebbins, H. C., | 31 W. 58th Street, " " " | | |
| Steers, James R., | 101 Park Avenue, " " " | | |
| Steinway, F. T., | Orchard St. and Jackson Ave., Long Island City, N. Y. | | |
| Stern, Benjamin, | 7 W. 53rd Street, New York City | | |
| Stewart, William R., | P. O. Box 258, " " " | | |
| Stimson, Daniel M., | 28 W. 37th Street, " " " | | |
| Stix, Sylvan L., | Hudson and N. Moore Streets, " " " | | |
| Stokes, Anson Phelps, Jr., (Life), | Yale University, New Haven, Conn | | |
| Stokes, Harold M. Phelps, (Life), | 229 Madison Avenue, New York City | | |
| Stokes, I. N. Phelps, (Life), | 118 E. 22nd Street, " " " | | |
| Stokes, James, | 84 William Street, " " " | | |
| Stokes, J. G. Phelps, (Life), | 229 Madison Avenue, " " " | | |
| Strasbourger, Samuel, | 74 Broadway, " " " | | |
| Straus, Oscar S., | 42 Warren Street, " " " | | |
| Strauss, Albert, | 3 South William Street, " " " | | |
| Strauss, Frederick, | 15 Broad Street, " " " | | |
| Strong, George A., | 43 Wall Street, " " " | | |
| Stuart, J. P. Whiton, | 8 E. 54th Street, " " " | | |

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|---|----------------|
| Sturges, S. Perry, | 52 Liberty Street, New York City | | |
| Sturgis, F. K., | 36 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Sulzberger, Cyrus L., | 516 West End Avenue, | " | " |
| Sulzberger, Ferdinand, | 802 First Avenue, | " | " |
| Taft, Henry W., | 40 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Taft, William H., 2nd | 8 Bridge Street, | " | " |
| Taggart, Rush, | 195 Broadway, | " | " |
| Tappan, J. B. Coles, | 49 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Tatham, Charles, | 261 Water Street, | " | " |
| Tatham, Edwin, | 133 East 36th Street, | " | " |
| Taussig, Walter M., | 9-15 Murray Street, | " | " |
| Taylor, E. P., Jr., | 80 Maiden Lane, | " | " |
| Taylor, Walter F., | 54 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Terry, Roderick, | | | Newport, R. I. |
| Terry, Seth Sprague, | 66 Broadway, | | New York City |
| Thacher, Archibald, | 49 East 51st Street, | " | " |
| Thacher, John S., | 839 Madison Avenue, | " | " |
| Thacher, Thomas, | 62 Cedar Street, | " | " |
| Thacher, Thomas, D., | 62 Cedar Street, | " | " |
| Thatcher, J. M. P., | 15 Dey Street, | " | " |
| Thomas, John H., | 9 Broadway, | " | " |
| Thomson, Herbert G., | 165 Broadway, | " | " |
| Thorne, Robert, | 30 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Thorne, Samuel, Jr., | 19 Cedar Street, | " | " |
| Thornton, William, | 18 Thomas Street, | " | " |
| Tinker, Edward L., | 40 Wall Street, | " | " |
| Tinkham, Julian R., | 42 Broadway, | " | " |
| Tison, Alexander, | 11 William Street, | " | " |
| Tod, J. Kennedy, | 5 Nassau Street, | " | " |
| Todd, Henry A., | 824 West End Avenue, | " | " |
| Tomkins, Calvin, | 17 Battery Place, | " | " |
| Tompkins, Hamilton B., | 80 Broadway, | " | " |
| Tower, George H., | 2 Rector Street, | " | " |
| Train, Arthur C., | 30 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Trowbridge, Alexander B., | 62 West 45th Street, | " | " |
| Tuckerman, Alfred, | University Club, | " | " |
| Tuckerman, Eliot, | 32 Liberty Street, | " | " |
| Tuckerman, Paul, | | | Tuxedo, N. Y. |
| Tweedy, J. F., | 11 Pine Street, | | New York City |
| Ulbrich, Gustav, | 30 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Unckles, D. S., | 957 St. Mark's Avenue, | | Brooklyn |
| Vail, Charles D., | | | Geneva, N. Y. |
| Valentine, Charles A., | 346 Fourth Avenue, | | New York City |
| Valentine, Henry C. (Life), | 257 Broadway, | " | " |
| Valentine, Robert G., | 27 State Street, | | Boston, Mass. |
| Van Dusen, Samuel C., | 32 Cliff Street, | | New York City |
| Van Ingen, Edward H., | 9 E. 71st Street, | " | " |
| Van Nest, George W., | 20 Broad Street, | " | " |
| Van Rensselaer, William S., | 1 East 51st Street, | " | " |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|---|
| Van Santvoord, R., | 10 W. 122nd Street, New York City |
| Vidal, J. E., | 393 St. Paul's Avenue, Stapleton, S. I. |
| Villard, Oswald Garrison, (Life), | 20 Vesey Street, New York City |
| Vineberg, Hiram N., | 751 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Wadsworth, James W., | Geneseo, N. Y. |
| Wagener, August P., | 51 Chambers Street, New York City |
| Walker, John, | Box 114, N. Diamond Station, Pittsburgh, Pa. |
| Walker, William, | Harbison & Walker, " " |
| Wallace, William H., | 66 Broadway, New York City |
| Wallace, W. J., | 209 W. 81st Street, " " " |
| Walling, William English, | 3 Fifth Avenue, " " " |
| Warburg, F. M., (Life), | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Warburg, Paul M., | 52 William Street, " " " |
| Ward, Henry Galbreath, | P. O. Building, " " " |
| Wardwell, Allen, | 15 Broad Street, " " " |
| Warren, Frank S., Jr., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| Warren, George A., | 1443 Massachusetts Avenue, N. W., Washington, D. C. |
| Warren, H. Langford, | 120 Boylston Street, Boston, Mass. |
| Webb, Willoughby L., | 37 Wall Street, New York City |
| Weed, John W., | 62 William Street, " " " |
| Weeks, John E., | 46 E. 57th Street, " " " |
| Weir, R. F., | Hague, N. Y. |
| Welch, Archibald A., | Woodland Street, Hartford, Conn. |
| Weld, Francis M., | 5 Nassau Street, New York City |
| Weller, Royal H., | Dist. Atty's Office, " " " |
| Welling, Richard, (Life) | 2 Wall Street, " " " |
| Wertheim, H. P., | 1 William Street, " " " |
| Westervelt, William Young, | 17 Madison Square, E., " " " |
| Wetmore, Edmund, | 34 Pine Street, " " " |
| Wheeler, Everett P., | 27 William Street, " " " |
| Wheeler, James R., | Columbia College, " " " |
| White, Alexander M., | 52 Remsen Street, Brooklyn |
| White, Andrew D., (Life), | Ithaca, N. Y. |
| White, Harold T., | 14 Wall Street, New York City |
| Whiteside, George W., | 27 William Street, " " " |
| Whiton, John M., | 73 William Street, " " " |
| Whitridge, Frederick W., | 59 Wall Street, " " " |
| Wickersham, C. W., | Hastings Hall, Cambridge, Mass. |
| Wickersham, George W., | |
| Wilcox, Ansley, | 295 Main Street, Buffalo, N. Y. |
| Wilds, Howard Payson, | University Club, New York City |
| Willcox, William G., | 3 South William Street, " " " |
| Williams, Benjamin A., | 22 E. 82nd Street, " " " |
| Williams, L. L., | 204 W. 110th Street, " " " |
| Williams, Richard H., | 1 Broadway, " " " |
| Williams, Roger H., | 31 W. 12th Street, " " " |
| Williams, Stephen G., | 953 Madison Avenue, " " " |
| Williams, William, | 1 West 54th Street, " " " |
| Williamson, Clifton P., | 165 Broadway " " " |
| Willis, Albert L., | 124 W. 183rd Street, " " " |
| Wilson, George Augustus, | Celeron, N. Y. |

| | | |
|---------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Wilson, Robert H., | | 260 Broadway, Brooklyn |
| Wingate, George W., | | 1100 Dean Street, " |
| Winters, Joseph E., | | 25 W. 37th Street, New York City |
| Winthrop, Bronson, | | 32 Liberty Street, " " " |
| Wise, E. E., | | 19 William Street, " " " |
| Wisner, Charles, | | Cotton Exchange, " " " |
| Wisner, H. G., | | 18 W. 12th Street, " " " |
| Witherbee F. S., | | 2 Rector Street, " " " |
| Wolff, Emil, | | 171 W. 71st Street, " " " |
| Wood, J. Leverne, | Care State Ins. Dept., | 165 Broadway, " " " |
| Wood, L. Hollingsworth, | | 2 Wall Street, " " " |
| Woodbridge, Charles E., | | 17 Battery Place, " " " |
| Worcester, Edwin D., Jr., | | 30 Broad Street, " " " |
| Wright, Jonathan, | | Second Avenue and 20th Street, " " " |
| Yonge, Henry, | | 391 Fulton Street, Brooklyn |
| Zabriskie, George, | | 49 Wall Street, New York City |
| Zollkoffer, Oscar F., | | 49 W. 54th Street, " " " |

ARTICLES OF INCORPORATION

OF

THE NEW YORK CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ASSOCIATION

[Filed May 11, 1900.]

KNOW ALL MEN BY THESE PRESENTS: That we, the undersigned, being persons of full age and all citizens of the United States, a majority of whom are also citizens of the State of New York, and being now Directors of an unincorporated association known as the New York Civil Service Reform Association, and organized for the purposes hereinafter mentioned; being desirous of incorporation for the same purposes under the Membership Corporations Law of the State of New York, do hereby, pursuant to unanimous vote of all the members of the said Association, present and voting at a regularly called meeting thereof, and pursuant to authority given by the said unanimous vote at the said meeting, of which meeting notice of the intention so to incorporate was given personally or by mail to each member of such Association whose residence or Post Office address was known, at least thirty days before said meeting, and at which meeting the corporate name stated in paragraph First was by unanimous vote adopted, do hereby certify as follows:

FIRST.—The name or title by which the Association in which we desire to form ourselves as aforesaid shall be known in law, shall be the Civil Service Reform Association.

SECOND.—The territory in which its operations are to be principally conducted shall be the City of New York.

THIRD.—The city in which its principal office is to be located is the City of New York.

FOURTH.—The objects of the Association shall be to further the establishment of a system of appointment, promotion and removal in the civil service, founded upon the principle that public office is a public trust, admission to and retention in which should depend upon proven fitness; and to take such action as may tend to secure the honest and efficient execution of laws and rules relating to the civil service, and to the proper administration thereof.

FIFTH.—The number of its directors shall be twenty-eight.

SIXTH.—The names of the persons to be its directors until its first annual meeting are as follows :

Samuel P. Avery, Truman J. Backus, Henry De Forest Baldwin, Edward Cary, Charles Collins, W. Bayard Cutting, Horace E. Deming, A. S. Frissell, Richard Watson Gilder, Edwin L. Godkin, J. Warren Greene, George McAneny, James McKeen, Jacob F. Miller, Samuel H. Ordway, William A. Perrine, George Foster Peabody, William J. Schieffelin, Carl Schurz, Charles A. Schieren, Thomas R. Slicer, Henry Sanger Snow, Anson Phelps Stokes, S. Perry Sturges, Henry W. Taft, William H. Thomson, Charles W. Watson and Everett P. Wheeler.

In WITNESS WHEREOF we have made, signed, acknowledged and filed this certificate in duplicate.

Dated this Eighth day of May, 1900.

C. SCHURZ,
JACOB F. MILLER,
ANSON PHELPS STOKES,
EVERETT P. WHEELER,
CHARLES COLLINS,
SAMUEL H. ORDWAY,
J. WARREN GREENE,

WILLIAM H. THOMSON,
A. S. FRISSELL,
GEORGE MCANENY,
CHARLES A. SCHIEREN,
SAMUEL P. AVERY,
GEORGE FOSTER PEABODY.

STATE OF NEW YORK, }
COUNTY OF NEW YORK, } ss.

On this eighth day of May, one thousand and nine hundred, before me personally came Carl Schurz, Jacob F. Miller, Anson Phelps Stokes, Everett P. Wheeler, Charles Collins, J. Warren Greene, William H. Thomson, Samuel H. Ordway, A. S. Frissell, George McAneny, Charles A. Schieren, Samuel P. Avery and George Foster Peabody, to me personally known to be the persons described in and who made and signed the foregoing certificate, and severally duly acknowledged to me that they had made, signed and executed the same for the uses and purposes therein set forth.

F. W. HOERSCHGEN,
Notary Public, Kings County. (149)
(Certificate filed in New York County.)

Approved, May 9, 1900.

DAVID LEVINTRITT,
Justice of the Supreme Court of the State of New York.

PUBLICATIONS OF THE NEW YORK CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ASSOCIATION

Annual Reports of the New York Civil Service Reform Association, 1895 to 1913, inclusive.

Term and Tenure of Office. By Dorman B. Eaton. (1882.)

Daniel Webster and the Spoils System. An extract from Senator Bayard's oration at Dartmouth College, June, 1882.

Address of Hon. Carl Schurz in opposition to the bill to amend the New York Civil Service Laws, commonly known as the "Black Act." May 6, 1897.

Retirement Legislation in New York. Report of a Special Committee. (1911.)

MISCELLANEOUS.

The Organization of the Modern Consular Service. By George McAneny. (Reprinted, by permission, from the Century Magazine, for February, 1899.)

The Reform of the Civil Service—Interest of Women in the Movement. By Mrs. George McAneny. Published by the Women's Auxiliary to the New York Civil Service Reform Association. (1900.)

Civil Service in Great Britain. By Dorman B. Eaton. Published by Harper & Brothers. (1881.)

The Relation of Civil Service Reform to Municipal Reform. By Carl Schurz. Published by the National Municipal League.

GOOD GOVERNMENT

Official Journal of the National Civil Service Reform League

PUBLISHED MONTHLY AT 79 WALL STREET, NEW YORK

ONE DOLLAR A YEAR TEN CENTS A COPY

Orders for the publications will be filled by ROBT. W. BELCHER
Secretary, 79 Wall St., New York.

OFFICERS—1913-1914.

PRESIDENT:

EVERETT P. WHEELER

VICE-PRESIDENTS:

CHARLES COLLINS
DAVID H. GREER
ABRAHAM JACOBI
WILLIAM G. LOW
LEVI P. MORTON

ELIHU ROOT
FRANCIS LYNDE STETSON
ANSON PHELPS STOKES
OSCAR S. STRAUS
HORACE WHITE

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE:

| | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| SAMUEL H. ORDWAY, <i>Chairman</i> | J. WARREN GREENE |
| HENRY DE FOREST BALDWIN | HENRY W. HARDON |
| GEORGE R. BISHOP | RUSSELL H. LOINES |
| ROSCOE C. E. BROWN | ALFRED BISHOP MASON |
| CHARLES C. BURLINGHAM | PHILIP J. MCCOOK |
| EDWARD CARY | JOHN G. MILBURN |
| GEORGE P. CHRISTIE | LUDWIG NISSEN |
| JOSEPH P. COTTON, Jr. | CARL L. SCHURZ |
| JONATHAN C. DAY | ISAAC N. SELIGMAN |
| HORACE E. DEMING | NELSON S. SPENCER |
| A. LEO EVERETT | WILLIAM H. THOMSON |
| A. S. FRISSELL | CHARLES W. WATSON |

SECRETARY:

ROBT. W. BELCHER

ASSISTANT SECRETARIES

GEORGE T. KEYES
HARRY W. MARSH

TREASURER:

A. S. FRISSELL

Offices of the Association,

79 WALL STREET, NEW YORK